CALIFORNIA CITIZENS COMPENSATION COMMISSION Meeting held 3-12-24 Transcript on 03/12/2024

1	CALIFORNIA CITIZENS COMPENSATION COMMISSION
2	
3	
4	
5	
6	
7	
8	
9	
10	TRANSCRIPTION OF RECORDED
11	CALIFORNIA CITIZENS COMPENSATION COMMISSION MEETING
12	HELD MARCH 12, 2024
13	
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	TRANSCRIBED BY: DONNA K. NICHOLS, RPR, CSR. 5660
24	JOB #: 8769
25	

```
1
              CHAIR SWEET: Good afternoon. It's 1:30 p.m.
    (unintelligible) . . .
 3
              (Microphone not turned on)
 4
              MS. SNARR: Laura Horrocks.
 5
              COMMISSIONER HORROCKS: Here, present.
 6
              MS. SNARR: Darrell Roberts.
 7
              COMMISSIONER ROBERTS: Present.
              MS. SNARR:
 8
                          Tyren Thompson.
 9
              COMMISSIONER THOMPSON: Present.
10
              MS. SNARR: Margaret Wong.
11
              COMMISSIONER WONG: Present.
12
              MS. SNARR: Michael Sweet.
13
              COMMISSIONER WONG: I don't think we hear you,
14
    Michael.
15
              CHAIR SWEET: How's that?
16
              COMMISSIONER WONG: Yes.
17
              CHAIR SWEET: Do I need to do that again or
18
    are you -- we're okay?
19
              Okay, we're good. Thank you. My apologies.
20
    It does say push.
21
              Very good. The first item on the agenda is
22
    public comment. This is an opportunity for members of
23
    the public who are attending the meeting to speak on
2.4
    issues within the purview of the Commission.
25
              If there's anyone who wishes to address the
```

```
Commission with public comment, now would be the time.
 1
    And we're -- I -- I see a five-minute clock.
                                                   I quess
 3
    we're limiting -- limiting public comment to five
    minutes per speaker.
 4
 5
              Is there anyone who wishes to address the
 6
    Commission at this time?
              Seeing none we'll close public comment.
 7
 8
              Could the Commission secretary please call the
 9
    next item.
10
              MS. SNARR: The next item is the adoption of
11
    minutes.
12
              CHAIR SWEET: The minutes of our June 22,
13
    2023, meeting are in the binders under the second tab
14
    and they were circulated to members of the Commission
    prior to today.
15
16
              I'd like to ask if any members of the
17
    Commission have changes or amendments to the minutes.
18
              Seeing none does one of the commissioners have
19
    a motion?
20
              COMMISSIONER HORROCKS: Motion to approve.
21
              CHAIR SWEET: Commissioner Horrocks motion to
22
    approve.
23
              COMMISSIONER ROBERTS:
                                     Second.
              CHAIR SWEET: Commissioner Roberts second.
2.4
              Consider a discussion on the motion.
25
```

```
1
              Could we have a vote, please.
              MS. SNARR: Laura Horrocks.
 3
              COMMISSIONER HORROCKS: Approved.
 4
              MS. SNARR: Darrell Roberts.
 5
              COMMISSIONER ROBERTS: Ave.
 6
              MS. SNARR:
                          Tyren Thompson.
              COMMISSIONER THOMPSON: Aye.
 7
              MS. SNARR: Margaret Wong.
 8
 9
              COMMISSIONER WONG: Approved.
10
              MS. SNARR: Michael Sweet.
11
              CHAIR SWEET:
                            Yes.
12
              We can call the next item.
13
              MS. SNARR: Next item is the Chair's report.
14
              CHAIR SWEET: Thank you. And -- and I'll keep
15
    this brief.
16
              I want to -- I want to thank the -- the staff
    who are here who've actually -- we've -- we've been in
17
18
    discussion over the past -- it's been a number of months
19
    now with -- with our counsel, Ms. Cohen, to talk about
20
    my observations as -- after attending the -- my first
21
    meeting in the middle of 2023 about the process and
22
    about the information presented and how we might help
23
    the commissioners to make good decisions and exercise
2.4
    their -- their responsibilities in a less compressed
25
    time frame than bringing us all together to vote on such
```

```
a consequential matter a week before the end of the
 1
    fiscal year.
 3
              The result of that was a decision to stretch
    the process out a little bit and to provide more content
 4
 5
    to the commissioners earlier so we can have a more
    informed discussion and opportunity to deliberate, and
 6
    then when we reach the -- reach the time to make the
    decision closer to the end of the fiscal year, it -- it
 8
 9
    isn't as rushed, and it isn't as compressed, and I think
10
    people can feel better about the process.
              The other byproduct of this is the opportunity
11
12
    to meet in person at -- at least once if not multiple
13
    times before the end of the -- the end of the fiscal
14
    year.
15
              So what we came up with was a -- a plan to
16
    hold three meetings. We're meeting today. We've
17
    scheduled meetings in May and June. It was my hope --
18
    although maybe we're -- I'm now learning that we have
19
    some conflicts, but it was my hope that we could do the
20
    May meeting virtually but our final meeting in June in
21
    person so that we could then exercise our responsibility
22
    to ultimately vote on -- on the compensation measures
```

So that's where we are. And that's what's happening today is we've -- I've asked for some

23

2.4

25

for the upcoming year.

```
presentations which I -- I think will be informative and
 1
    instructive and we can begin the deliberative process
 3
    now.
              The other dates that we've marked out are May
 4
 5
    22nd for a -- a Zoom meeting and then June 18th for an
    in-person meeting. But I now understand that we may
 6
    need to see about either changing what's Zoom and what's
    in person or maybe changing -- adjusting the dates a
 8
 9
    little bit. So we'll work with staff and we'll ask them
10
    to -- to poll people and -- and see what works.
    Certainly I think it's preferential for me and for all
11
12
    of us to be here in person if we can or together in
13
    person, not necessarily here, but --
14
              And I don't know, we -- we can't do a hybrid
15
    Zoom in-person meeting, it has to be one or the other;
16
    is that correct, Ms. Cohen?
17
              MS. COHEN: It would be considered a
18
    teleconference meeting and we'd have to abide by all the
19
    teleconference requirement to do it both in person and
20
    by Zoom.
              CHAIR SWEET: But we could -- so we could
21
22
    convene in person with -- with commissioners
23
    participating virtually as well, we would just have to
2.4
    follow different rules? Is that --
25
              MS. COHEN: I -- I believe so. I'd have to
```

```
check the new law that just went in to effect beginning
 1
    of the year, but I believe so.
 3
              CHAIR SWEET:
                            Okay.
 4
              MS. COHEN: There may be extra hoops to jump
 5
    through but we'll -- we'll look in to it.
 6
              CHAIR SWEET: It wouldn't be a -- it wouldn't
   be a state commission if there weren't hoops.
 8
              MS. COHEN: Correct.
 9
                            Thank you. That's -- that's all
              CHAIR SWEET:
10
    I have.
11
              Although it does occur to me that we have a
12
    new member and we haven't ever actually met in person,
13
    the others of us. So maybe if our new commissioner can
14
    introduce himself. Actually, we'll have everyone
15
    introduce themselves, but why don't you -- you want to
16
    go -- go ahead and go first.
17
              COMMISSIONER ROBERTS: Hi. Good afternoon.
18
    My name is Darrell Roberts. I'm a professional
19
    firefighter out of Chula Vista, California, where I've
20
    served my home town and the State of California for the
21
    last 25 years.
22
              I'm also a member of our Urban Search and
23
    Rescue Team, California Task Force 8. And I've been
2.4
    involved in our labor leadership in the State of
25
    California for the last 15 years.
```

```
1
              So thank you everybody.
              CHAIR SWEET: Commissioner Horrocks.
 3
              COMMISSIONER HORROCKS: Hello. My name is
   Laura Horrocks. I am local to the greater Sacramento
 4
 5
   area. And I support our non-profit seat on this board.
    I've spent nine years working at PRIDE Industries and
 6
    supporting local non-profits as well. Thank you.
              COMMISSIONER THOMPSON: Everyone, Commissioner
 8
 9
   Tyren Thompson. Thank you for allowing me to be here.
10
              I join you all from South Orange County in
   Rancho Santa Margarita. And I'd like to extend a
11
12
    sincere thank you to our staff for the organization of
13
   the materials and to our presenters and wish you all a
14
   happy Women's History Month.
15
              COMMISSIONER WONG: Yes. My name is Margaret
16
           I'm local here. I've been in Sacramento for 40
   Wona.
17
   years. Very lucky of me to come here locally. I'm an
18
   entrepreneur, a small business, and involved with
   manufacturing with technology, high-tech products.
19
20
              CHAIR SWEET:
                            Thank you. And I'm Michael
21
            I'm from San Francisco. I was appointed Chair
   Sweet.
22
   of the Commission last spring. So I've been on the
23
   Commission a little under a year at this point. I'm a
24
   practicing attorney. I'm also a member of the San
25
   Francisco Human Rights Commission.
```

```
And with that unless I missed anything I will
 1
 2
    conclude the Chair's report and ask staff to call the
 3
    next item.
 4
              MS. SNARR: The next item are the staff
 5
              These are reports that are contained in the
    binder that you have in front of you. So I'll just go
 6
    through the tabs, go over what we have.
 8
              So the first tab is the agenda for today,
 9
    today's meeting. We have the unofficial transcripts
10
    from the June 22, '23 meeting. Next --
              COMMISSIONER THOMPSON: Excuse me. On the
11
12
    transcripts my name is inaccurately listed as Tyrone
13
    starting on page two and five times throughout.
14
              MS. SNARR: Okay. Thank you. We will make
15
    sure that's corrected.
16
              COMMISSIONER THOMPSON:
                                      Thank you.
17
              MS. SNARR: Next in the binder are the meeting
18
    minutes from the June 2023 meeting, the resolution from
19
    the June 2023 meeting as well, and the salary and
2.0
    benefit resolution.
21
              Next are the -- the salary surveys from state
22
    elected officials as well as city officials and school
23
    district superintendents as well as county elected
2.4
    officials.
25
              Next we have the superior court judges
```

```
salaries from 2010 up to 2023. Then we have the state
 1
    executive salary levels, the Civil Service salary report
 3
    from 2010 to 2023. Then we have the 2024 summary of
    constitutional and legislative officer benefits. Then
 4
 5
    we have the action summary chart for the Commission from
    1990 to 2023.
 6
 7
              The last tab is -- is a spot saved for the DOF
    certification letter. So we should have that mid May.
 8
    Once -- once that's available we will provide a copy to
 9
10
    you. So hopefully we'll have that for -- prior to May's
11
    meeting.
12
              CHAIR SWEET:
                            Thank you.
13
              Do any commissioners have questions or
14
    comments on any of the items that -- that are in the --
15
    that are in the binder?
16
              COMMISSIONER HORROCKS: I just want to say
17
    thank you for preparing all of these for us. This is a
18
    lot of really great information.
19
              CHAIR SWEET: Anyone else?
2.0
              I -- I do have a question.
21
              Under the superior court tab I know -- I
22
    notice that this shows the increases, but there's no
23
    indication on this document as to what the -- what the
2.4
    starting point was or the base line.
              Is that information available and is it
25
```

```
consistent or does it vary?
 1
 2
              MS. SNARR: Are you asking in terms of the
 3
    actual percentages in which they increased each year?
 4
              CHAIR SWEET: I'm asking, like, what -- what
 5
    was the starting point? What's the -- what is the base
    salary on which the increase has -- has been -- to which
 6
    the increase has been added? And if that's not
    available now, I'll just ask that we include that as a
 9
    supplement for -- at the next meeting.
10
              MS. SNARR: We can include that for -- for the
    next meeting if you'd like --
11
12
              CHAIR SWEET:
                            Thank you.
13
              MS. SNARR: -- as a staff report.
14
              CHAIR SWEET: Okay. I see no other questions,
15
    and I will ask the Commission -- yes, go ahead.
16
              COMMISSIONER THOMPSON: I'm wondering if these
17
    are monthly amounts. Do we know if these are increases
18
    or monthly amounts?
19
              MS. SNARR: These are the monthly amounts.
20
              COMMISSIONER THOMPSON: These are the
21
    monthly -- so these are the salaries.
22
              MS. SNARR:
                          Judges, yes.
23
              COMMISSIONER THOMPSON: Can we annualize this
24
   maybe?
25
              MS. SNARR: We can do that.
```

```
1
              COMMISSIONER THOMPSON:
                                      Okay.
              MS. SNARR: We can provide both.
 3
              COMMISSIONER THOMPSON: Would that be helpful?
 4
              CHAIR SWEET: Yeah, of course.
 5
              MS. SNARR: Okav.
 6
              CHAIR SWEET: Great. Thank you. Good -- good
 7
    catch.
              Very good. With that we can move to the next
 8
 9
    item if the Commission secretary will please call the
10
    item.
11
              MS. SNARR: Next we have a presentation by the
12
    California Department of Human Resources regarding
13
    collective bargaining updates and other compensation
14
    setting considerations.
15
              MR. CRAWFORD: All right. Can you hear me?
16
              CHAIR SWEET: Yes.
17
              MR. CRAWFORD: If I can get these slides
18
    going.
           There we go.
19
              All right, first off I'd like to say thank you
2.0
    to the Chair and commissioners for having me today.
                                                         Μy
    name is Anthony Crawford. I'm a Deputy Director at
21
22
    CalHR.
            I'm here to present on state employee
23
    compensation and recent collective bargaining updates
2.4
    tied to state employee compensation. I think it might
25
    interest you.
```

1 So first I'll start with the first slide here just to discuss who we are as a department. So CalHR 3 represents the governor during contract negotiations 4 with the state's 21 bargaining units. We have 5 represented employees split in to these 21 bargaining units based on the occupations, and they make up 6 approximately 205,000 positions within state government. In total we have 13 unions with SEIU being our 8 9 largest employee union representing nine of our 10 collective bargaining units as you can see in the chart. 11 And these classifications range from janitors, to IT 12 classifications, to nurses, and cooks just to name a 13 few. 14 In addition to our represented employees we 15 have employees who are excluded from collective 16 bargaining in which CalHR has salary-setting authority 17 for. Our excluded employees are mostly made up of 18 supervisors, managers, or confidential employees who 19 work in the labor relations field. In total we have 20 about 47,000 positions for our excluded employees. 21 So as you can see on the next slide, in total 22 we have about two hundred -- over 250,000 state 23 employees in total. And I should clarify that that is 24 just within the executive branch of state government. 25 So this does not include any judicial or legislative

```
employees or any state employees working for the higher
 1
    education systems.
 3
              What I show here is that we have about 252,000
 4
    positions that fall under one large statewide
 5
    classification plan which is made up of over 2,700
    classifications.
 6
 7
              Those have all been mapped to
    federally-defined occupation groups. As you can see, we
 8
 9
    have almost 400 occupation groups within our state
10
    classification structure.
11
              And, again, we have many occupations
12
    throughout our entire state workforce that range from
13
    entry level student assistants, to seasonal employees,
14
    lawyers, doctors, peace officers, and firefighters as
15
    well.
              How many actual employees we may actually have
16
17
    on payroll at any given point in time can depend just
18
    based on normal attrition throughout the year or due to
19
    the seasonal nature of our work. We have certain peak
20
    times of the year, either -- for example, like
21
    firefighters during fire season we may have more
22
    firefighters or even during the summer we have more
23
    lifequards.
2.4
              So one of the things that CalHR's responsible
25
    for is completing a total compensation report for each
```

bargaining unit on a biannual basis. These reports are 1 submitted to the legislature and are publically available on our website. And to complete these reports 3 we work closely with the federal Bureau of Labor 4 5 Statistics who provide us with wage and benefit data for public and private sector employers within the State of 6 California. 8 CalHR calculates the state employee 9 compensation levels using actual state payroll data from 10 the State Controller's Office. And we have used the BLS methodology of how they define benefits and wages so 11 12 that we can do a comparison to comparable occupations in 13 other sectors. So as I've said, we've already mapped our 14 15 2,700 state classifications to the federally-defined 16 occupation groups and that allows us to use the federal data that we receive from the BLS. 17 18 When we do these compensation studies, most of 19 them look at the employer cost. So we think about it as 20 how much does it cost the state to fill a state 21 position. 22 As we know, that includes much more than just 23 the salary that the employee receives. It also includes 2.4 additional forms of compensation above their base salary 25 such as pay differentials which could be for geographic

2.4

pay or seniority pay that an employee may receive which many of our peace officers are eligible for.

In addition to that we look at costs related to contributions such as retirement or prefunding retiree health care as well as contributions to active benefits such as health, dental, and vision as well.

The last bullet there just talks about compensation generally speaking. There's different forms of compensation that we have within our state salary structure.

So thinking about it more from an employee standpoint of how much they are taking home there's different types of salary increases that we may think about during negotiations or we may extend to our excluded employees.

So to name a few one is what we refer to as a general salary increase. This is a salary increase for all employees within a specific bargaining unit that is eligible for that increase. That's regardless of where they may fall within a salary range. They could have started with the state two months ago or they could have been with the state for 20 years. They will be eligible for that general salary increase.

We also have what we call special salary adjustments which can be targeted adjustments for a

specific group of classifications that we may negotiate to address specific recruitment and retention challenges that we may be facing.

Another form of a special salary adjustment is something we call a special salary adjustment at max which we negotiated recently with some bargaining units. This refers to an adjustment to the maximum of a salary of a classification salary range. So employees aren't necessarily eligible for it, we're just increasing their earning potential that they may receive as part of their normal progression through the classification.

The last item I listed was pay differentials. As I alluded to, there's different types of differentials such as geographic pay differentials for certain cities, regions within the state and also as I mentioned seniority or longevity pay.

So this chart I put together here really focuses more on the collective bargaining updates of what we've done recently. This is kind of a five-year snapshot of salary increases and adjustments we've provided or will be providing.

The percentages in white as you see there are what I referred to as general salary increases. So all of those percentages go to every single state employee within that bargaining unit.

The percentages highlighted in green are not general salary increases but instead are special salary adjustments at max. So as I mentioned, employees may not receive those right away, they have to get to the max of the salary range and it becomes part of their normal salary progression. So I highlighted those just because you can see certain bargaining units have negotiated those in recent contracts.

Another example I highlighted in orange there was in 2022. We negotiated a larger salary increase for peace officers compared to the non-peace officers within that specific bargaining unit. So we -- we did this as part of a contract because also included in the total compensation package we negotiated for that unit we asked peace officers to contribute more out of pocket to retirement. And that's not something that was asked of the non-peace officers. So as part of that thinking of a total compensation package you can see how we really think about other factors that impact year end take-home pay beyond just salary increases.

So also included in the chart here on the far right is what has already been negotiated and scheduled for state employees in these bargaining units effective July 1st, '24.

The next chart here shows another employee

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

- contribution that impacts take-home pay, and these are 1 our retirement contributions. Consistent with the 3 Public Employees Pension Reform Act, or as we refer to it PEPRA, the state seeks to have a 50/50 cost sharing 4 5 split of the total normal costs of an employee's However, as you can see in the chart, between 6 the different bargaining units the contribution rates vary and that's because for state employees those rates 8 9 are subject to collective bargaining. 10 So as an example I've highlighted in yellow miscellaneous employees that work for different -- are 11 12 part of different bargaining units. And, as you can
 - miscellaneous employees that work for different -- are part of different bargaining units. And, as you can see, they are contributing different amounts. Some are eight and a half, some are eight, and others are at ten percent because that was what was negotiated.

Highlighted in orange is the same Bargaining Unit 7 example from the salary chart on the previous slide just to kind of illustrate the difference in the peace officers and non-peace officers within that bargaining unit.

So, again, in one specific year we provided more in salary increases. Here you can see just what the current contribution rates are and you can see that peace officers are contributing 15 percent whereas the non-peace officers are only at eleven-and-a-half

1 percent. 2 And, lastly, this is employee retiree health 3 contributions. So this is looking at the state's pre-funding policy, pre-funding retiree health care. 4 5 This policy has been in place for well over ten years. As you can see in the first column, prior to 6 2016/'17, some bargaining units were contributing to OPEB, and then most recently in about '17/'18 is when we 8 9 negotiated for all bargaining units and started over at 10 three- to four-year phase in. And this chart shows you the incremental increases to those rates over the years. 11 12 And then the far right-hand column you can see 13 what the current employee contribution to that is. And 14 I -- I show this also to illustrate that between the 15 different bargaining units we had different rates for 16 this as well as negotiated through the collective 17 bargaining process. So with that that concludes the slides and the 18 19 presentation I have. I hope that provides a little bit 20 of insight in to our state employee compensation 21 practices, and I'd be happy to answer any questions that 22 you may have. 23 CHAIR SWEET: Any commissioner questions? 2.4 COMMISSIONER WONG: I have a question that is 25 the state is the largest employer in California?

```
MR. CRAWFORD: I don't know the answer to
 1
          I'll have to double check.
 3
              COMMISSIONER WONG: Because I was told is the
    state is number one, the fed is number two, and then UC
 4
 5
    California is number three. So I don't know -- so
    252,000, you know, position . . .
 6
 7
              MR. CRAWFORD: Yeah, I'll -- I'll have to
           I know when you add in higher ed and -- and you
 8
 9
    look at judicial and legislative branch I think there's
10
    about 450,000 total which is pretty significant, but I
11
    can get you the exact numbers, yeah.
12
              COMMISSIONER WONG:
                                  Thank you.
13
              COMMISSIONER THOMPSON: Can we go back to
14
    slide two, please.
15
              MR. CRAWFORD: Sure.
16
              COMMISSIONER THOMPSON: I'm wondering if you
17
    know what percentage each bargaining unit represents of
18
    the total employee population.
19
              MR. CRAWFORD: I don't have it in front of me.
20
    I know offhand SEIU has over a hundred thousand
21
    positions which is pretty significant when you -- so
22
    more than 50 percent of the rank and file. But I can
23
    get you a chart that has the percentages if you'd like.
2.4
              COMMISSIONER THOMPSON:
                                      I was mainly
25
    interested in the SEIU because we've used them to sort
```

```
of inform our decisions. So over fifty percent.
 1
 2
              MR. CRAWFORD: Yeah, so they have 107,000
 3
    positions of the 205,000 represented positions. So
 4
    107,000 of. In total we have two hundred and fifty two.
 5
              COMMISSIONER THOMPSON:
                                      Thank you.
              CHAIR SWEET: Anyone else?
 6
 7
              I -- I have a question. Go back to slide I
    think six.
 8
 9
              So in -- on this far right column here six and
10
    then also on the last slide, this is a percentage.
    Eight point five percent is of the total salary, is that
11
12
    right?
13
              MR. CRAWFORD: That -- that would be of their
14
    pensionable compensation. So in addition to their base
15
    salary some pay differentials they receive are what we
16
    call PERSable and are factored in to their final
17
    compensation. So that's a percentage of all of that,
18
    the base plus PERSable pay differential.
19
              CHAIR SWEET: So if -- if the base and the
20
    PERSable is a hundred thousand, then they would pay
21
    eight -- 8,500?
22
              MR. CRAWFORD: Right.
23
              CHAIR SWEET: And that's on the last slide.
2.4
    The same -- that's the same also there?
25
              MR. CRAWFORD: Same thing, correct, yeah.
```

```
1
              COMMISSIONER THOMPSON: While we're on this
    slide in the past looks like three, four years a
 3
    significant number of reductions.
 4
              Can you speak to why that is?
 5
              MR. CRAWFORD: Sure.
                                    That's a product of
    collective bargaining consistent with the PEPRA policy
 6
    on the pension side. With the pre funding of retiree
    health care we seek to have employees contribute 50/50
 8
 9
    of the total normal cost of the benefits. As the -- the
10
    changes in health care costs go up and go down and
11
    changes in payroll account for how much they need to
12
    contribute there can be adjustments, but . . . Yeah.
13
              COMMISSIONER THOMPSON: I have a question on
14
    slide five too. You can tell we really enjoyed your
15
    presentation.
16
              I think I heard that you mentioned that all
17
    employees are eligible for a three percent. Did you say
18
    that?
19
              MR. CRAWFORD:
                             I did not.
2.0
              COMMISSIONER THOMPSON: Okay.
21
              MR. CRAWFORD: So depending on which
22
    bargaining unit they're in the far right column will
23
    show you what they will receive next July 1st.
2.4
              COMMISSIONER THOMPSON: Okay. Perfect.
                                                       Thank
25
    you.
```

```
COMMISSIONER WONG: I have one question.
 1
                                                        You
    used the word that you negotiate.
 3
              Who do you negotiate with? Negotiate with the
    union, negotiate with the -- with certain department?
 4
 5
    What's are your negotiations?
              MR. CRAWFORD: Yeah. So we negotiate with the
 6
    unions.
             So employees have exclusive representatives.
    And that's on chart two. So in the first column of the
 8
 9
    chart it identifies which union represents employees
10
    within those occupations.
11
              COMMISSIONER WONG: Okay. Thank you.
12
              CHAIR SWEET: Anyone -- any other questions?
13
              COMMISSIONER HORROCKS: A quick question.
14
              Can you go back to the slide with the
15
    percentage increases. I think it was six. This one.
16
    Five.
17
              If the green percentages are the special
18
    salary adjustments, do we have a base line for what the
19
    general population is eligible for?
20
              MR. CRAWFORD: I -- I don't have it in front
21
           But you'd only receive that increase if you have
22
    been at the max salary for twelve months of your
23
    classification. Again, eventually you'll get there.
                                                          So
24
    if you're at the minimum today, it increases your
25
    earning potential, and then that percentage would vary
```

```
depending on the bargaining unit. But if you're
 1
    interested, I can get you that information. Yeah.
 3
              CHAIR SWEET: So let me -- I'll ask, and maybe
    it's not something that you're in a position to speak
 4
 5
    to. But a little bit more explanation of how these
    percentages are instructive to us in our ultimate
 6
    decision as -- when we make our -- when we make a
    decision about the -- the increases for the
 8
    constitutional officers and the members of the
 9
10
    legislature.
11
              Can you explain the -- the tie in here?
12
              MR. CRAWFORD: I don't think I can.
                                                   T think
13
    I'm more here to inform you on what we've done for state
14
    employee salaries, yeah.
15
              CHAIR SWEET: Okay.
16
              COMMISSIONER THOMPSON: Can you advise on
17
    which bargaining unit does most similar work to the
    elected officials?
18
19
              MR. CRAWFORD: I don't think I'm allowed to
20
    advise at this point. Again, I'm just here to provide
21
    information on what --
22
              COMMISSIONER THOMPSON:
                                      Thank you.
23
              COMMISSIONER ROBERTS:
                                     Anthony, I do have one
2.4
    question.
              On the '24/'25 on the slide that we're on
25
```

```
looks like our CHP officers, firefighters, and
 1
    scientists are grayed out.
 3
              Is that still -- are bargaining sessions still
 4
    ongoing?
 5
              MR. CRAWFORD: I can't speak to ongoing
    negotiations or where we're at with that but this just
 6
    reflects what has or has not been negotiated. So for
 8
    those three bargaining units that you identified there's
 9
    nothing currently scheduled.
10
              COMMISSIONER ROBERTS:
                                     Thank you.
11
              CHAIR SWEET: Anything else?
12
              Thank you very much.
13
              MR. CRAWFORD: Thank you. Appreciate it.
14
              CHAIR SWEET: Call the next item, please.
15
              MS. SNARR: Next item on the agenda is a
16
    presentation by the California Department of Finance
17
    regarding the state budget and other FIS$Cal
18
    considerations.
19
              MR. TENNEFOSS: Good afternoon. Can you hear
2.0
   me?
21
              Thank you. All right. Good afternoon, Aston
22
    Tennefoss, Department of Finance. I first thank you for
23
    your service on the Commission and I'll just give you a
2.4
    brief overview of the purpose of this presentation.
25
              The intent is to provide you an overview of
```

```
the state budget, the governor's budget as presented on
 1
    June 10, and to inform you of any other potential
 3
    information items that may be useful in your
 4
    deliberations on the Commission.
 5
              All right, the 2024 governor's budget
    includes a balanced budget of 291.5 billion in
 6
    expenditures. Those expenditures include solutions for
    a projected shortfall of 37.9 billion. It's important
 8
 9
    to note that this is all a point in time data based upon
10
    a forecast made prior to having all revenue information.
11
              There was an unprecedented delay in the filing
12
    which was delayed from October and then ultimately to
13
    November after the 2022 tax year and as a result review
14
    of the governor's budget as being a correction to some
15
    of that information. And we'll get more in to that in
16
    a -- in a second.
17
              Just high-level revenues come in in what we
18
    call the big three. That is the personal income tax,
19
    the sales and use tax, and corporate income taxes. And
2.0
    then on a future slide I'll also have a breakdown of
21
    where the expenditures land, but the top three there are
22
    K-12 education, health services, and human services.
23
              All right, so this slide shows you a history
2.4
    of the big three revenues going back almost three
25
    decades. And I'd just like to call your attention to
```

```
the upper right-hand corner where you can see that there
 1
    was a pretty large spike between 2019/'20 and '21/'22
 3
    over the COVID period. And then following that we see
    that there was this downward trajectory.
 4
 5
              The black line for those watching is the
 6
    '24/'25 governor's budget. The dark blue line is the
 7
    '23 Budget Act. And then respectively the dashed black
    is 4.5 percent annual growth, and the blue is five
 8
 9
    percent annual growth. And the intent of showing that
10
    is that, again, is we view this as a correction. You
    can see that revenues continue to grow, however, we have
11
12
    corrected back down to some of the more normal trend
13
    between four-and-a-half and five percent.
14
              This slide shows the aggregate of the General
15
    Fund expenditures. General Fund expenditures of 208.7
16
    billion for the '24/'25 budget. As mentioned before,
17
    K-12 education, health services, and human services are
18
    those top three followed closely by higher education.
19
              And then just for additional information
20
    within the other section that includes things like Labor
21
    Workforce Development Agency, general government, and
22
    Gov Ops.
23
              I guess I should also note that this is a
2.4
    revision down of approximately 9.6 percent from the
25
    '23/'24 budget.
```

1 So within this there are several mechanisms in order to balance the budget that were included. 3 include pulling from the reserves revenue and internal 4 borrowing. For example, within reserves there's a 12.2 5 billion proposed decrease or, rather, removal from the budget stabilization account as well as drawing down 900 6 million from the safety net reserve. In the revenue space, for example, there's an 8 9 increase in the managed care organization tax support. 10 Moving to the second bullet among the reductions 11 departments have been instructed to only focus on those 12 essential spending items, and in that potential savings 13 is supported. And then finally the delays and deferrals 14 are items that have expenditures in to the future. 15 So moving to this next slide this is 16 particularly relevant in terms of the Commission's 17 charge. The Special Fund for economic uncertainties is 18 included in the constitution. There was an item --19 rather, a proposition introduced in 2009, Prop 1F, which 20 specified certain requirements constitutionally for the 21 SFEU and specifically for the Director of Finance to 22 certify via a letter of the condition of the Special 23 Fund for economic uncertainties. 2.4 And so you can see here that again point in 25 time as of the '24/'25 governor's budget that amount was

```
negative 2.5 billion projected. And that represents
 1
    approximately 1.3 percent in the negative of the General
 3
    Fund revenues.
 4
              All right, and then coming in to the final
 5
    slide here. Just to give you sort of a sense of where
    things stand at the moment as of January our revenues
 6
    were down by five billion for the month of January and
    then fiscal year to date 5.9 billion or 4.8 percent.
 8
 9
              Just wanted to note that, again, the May
10
    revision is coming and so all of these numbers are
11
    potentially going to change. The governor's budget is a
12
    proposal and so through conversation with the
13
    legislature and various stakeholders, you know, we
14
    arrive at a final value. So those revenue numbers may
15
    change over time. But the final letter will be provided
16
    by the Director of Finance on or before June 1st based
17
    on the May revision.
18
              Thank you. Happy to take any questions.
19
              CHAIR SWEET: You referred there at the end to
    the final letter.
2.0
21
              Can you explain to the Commission what -- what
22
    that letter is and why it's important to our work.
23
              MR. TENNEFOSS: Yes. So the certification
2.4
    letter I believe was mentioned previously as coming in
25
    May. So the requirement in the constitution is that it
```

```
is delivered June 1st or before based on the status of a
 1
    Special Fund for economic uncertainties.
 3
              The constitutional requirement is that a
    resolution may not go forward if the various conditions
 4
 5
    within the constitution are met. So those being the
    negative status of the SFEU and then also if it
 6
    represents more -- one percent or more of the General
 8
    Fund revenues.
 9
              CHAIR SWEET: And the -- the meaning being
10
    that if those conditions aren't met, then we -- we
    cannot act to provide increases, right?
11
12
              MR. TENNEFOSS: If those conditions are met,
13
    then a resolution may not move forward to provide
14
    increases, otherwise you have the authority to make a
15
    decision.
16
              CHAIR SWEET:
                            Thank you.
17
              With that we'll go to Ms. Horrocks.
18
              COMMISSIONER HORROCKS: Can you -- the fund
19
    needs to be at what percentage? In order --
20
              MR. TENNEFOSS: So -- so the comparer is to be
21
    one percent or more of General Fund revenues to the
22
    negative. So that -- it's -- it's a negative argument
23
    so in that if it's anything less than that or in the
24
    positive, it has no impact.
25
              COMMISSIONER HORROCKS: Okay. So the fact
```

```
that we're at 1.3 to the negative tells us --
 1
              MR. TENNEFOSS: As of -- as of the current
 2
 3
    projections it would suggest that the constitutional
 4
    trigger would be met.
 5
              COMMISSIONER HORROCKS: Okay.
                                             Thank vou.
 6
              CHAIR SWEET: Thank you. Any other questions
 7
    from the Commission?
              COMMISSIONER THOMPSON: Yes. One of the early
 8
 9
    slides you talked about the big three expenditures.
10
              Can you define for us what health and human
11
    services are or give us examples?
12
              MR. TENNEFOSS: Oh, yes. So health services
13
    would be services provided by, for example, the
14
    Department of Public Health versus human services might
15
    be the Department of Social Services.
16
              COMMISSIONER THOMPSON:
                                      Thank you.
17
              COMMISSIONER WONG: I have a question that --
18
    do we have any reserve fund, that how much we have, or
19
    we have zero?
20
              MR. TENNEFOSS: So there are various reserves
    for specifically legislative stabilization account,
21
22
    public school stabilization -- I'm going to get
23
    this wrong -- it's PSSSA. I'm blanking on the name
24
    right now. But those are two and then the safety net
25
    reserve and also the -- the safety -- or the SFEU which
```

```
I mentioned previously.
 1
              And so after the legislations have been
 2
 3
    introduced there will still be 18.4 billion in reserves
    within a combination of those accounts, yes.
 4
 5
              COMMISSIONER WONG: Did the delay of the tax
    filing return last year affect the cash flow in the
 6
    deficit?
              MR. TENNEFOSS: It affected the forecasting
 8
 9
    and, therefore, we're correcting that forecast now.
10
              COMMISSIONER WONG:
                                  Thank you.
11
              COMMISSIONER THOMPSON: And you had a chart a
12
    few slides up that showed the -- this slide.
13
              Can you speak again to the big spike between
14
    '19 and '20 there that you said is being corrected now?
15
    But what caused it in the first place?
16
              MR. TENNEFOSS: I don't have that specific
17
    information --
18
              COMMISSIONER THOMPSON: Okay.
19
              MR. TENNEFOSS: -- in front of me, only to
20
    say that these -- this is reporting the actual. So
21
    those were the revenues that came in during that period.
22
              COMMISSIONER THOMPSON:
                                      Thank you.
23
              COMMISSIONER ROBERTS: I had a question on
2.4
    the -- on the reserves. We pulled out 18.8 billion?
                                                           Is
25
    that correct, out of reserves --
```

```
1
              MR. TENNEFOSS:
                              I'm sorry --
 2
              COMMISSIONER ROBERTS: -- or is that a total
 3
    combination? I forget the slide, it was, like, three --
 4
              MR. TENNEFOSS: Oh, the eighteen -- yeah, 18.4
 5
    remaining, yes.
              COMMISSIONER ROBERTS: What -- what percentage
 6
    of that is of our total reserve accounts?
              MR. TENNEFOSS: I'm afraid I don't understand
 8
 9
    the question.
10
              COMMISSIONER ROBERTS: We pulled out 18.8 from
11
    reserves to -- to meet --
12
              MR. TENNEFOSS: So I quess I can go --
13
              (Speaking over each other)
14
              COMMISSIONER ROBERTS: Can you put that
15
    slide --
              MR. TENNEFOSS: Yeah. I can go back to the
16
17
    slide.
18
              So -- oh, yeah.
                               Yes.
19
              So 18.8 includes from the reserves -- I have
20
    another amount here. So in total within the governor's
21
    budget 13.1 billion is being pulled from reserves.
22
              COMMISSIONER ROBERTS: Okay, thank you.
23
              COMMISSIONER HORROCKS: On this slide when
2.4
    we're talking about reductions in fund shifts, can you
25
    give some examples of what that means in this
```

```
(unintelligible) dollars?
 1
              MR. TENNEFOSS: Yes.
                                    Yes.
 3
              So, for example, within the governor's budget
 4
    there are reductions to climate of 2.9 billion, various
 5
    housing programs of 1.2 billion, school facilities
    eight, program 500 million. And then in terms of fund
 6
    shifts there is a proposal to shift various funding from
    the General Fund to the Greenhouse Gas Reduction Fund
 8
 9
    and that is in the amount of 1.8 billion.
10
              CHAIR SWEET: Any additional commissioner
11
    questions?
12
              Thank you, Aston.
13
              MR. TENNEFOSS: Thank you.
14
              CHAIR SWEET: Will you call the next item,
15
    please.
16
              MS. SNARR: Next item is the discussion
17
    regarding the annual process and timetable for
18
    formulating and approving a resolution setting
19
    compensation.
20
              CHAIR SWEET: So I gave -- there's no staff
21
    presentation on this, correct?
22
              Okay, this is me.
23
              This is what we've been discussing and -- and
2.4
    my thought that we should provide ourselves a little
25
    more runway here.
```

```
So I previewed this earlier, but this is an
 1
 2
    opportunity now for the commissioners to share their
 3
    thoughts about our deliberative process, and the timing,
    and the cadence. And, you know, also I -- I appreciate
 4
 5
    the fact that we -- we didn't have full clearance.
    were down a commissioner and have now added one. I
 6
    would love to see everyone in person for the final vote.
    So maybe we'll have an adjustment there or do a hybrid
 8
 9
    meetina.
10
              But I'd like to invite each of the
    commissioners to share their thoughts on -- on how we're
11
12
    going to do this this year so that we can engage in the
    most productive process. And I'll just open the floor
13
14
    at this point.
15
              COMMISSIONER WONG: Well, thank you. Thank
16
    you, I -- I found the presentation to be very helpful.
17
    Thank you, gentlemen. Understanding their job, you
18
    know, updates and -- and the budget situation in
19
    particularly as is going to affect what we're going to
20
    be deciding. And I think there's always is -- is good
21
    that, you know, Chairman, you know, they're suggesting
22
    that we have, you know, various meeting, discussion and
23
    to come to the conclusion.
24
              And I think that, you know, we have been not
25
    running a deficit in the past, but we are running a
```

```
deficit right now, so -- and this is important, that we
 1
    need to take a deep look in to what it is in front of us
 3
    and be able to make a -- a wiser decision.
 4
              So I -- I support that.
 5
              COMMISSIONER THOMPSON: Yes, Commissioner
           I would agree. I'm in support of two more
 6
    meetings. I really do enjoy meeting you all in person.
 8
              Thank you to Aston and Anthony for their
 9
    presentations. I think the context -- it helps provide
10
    context in our decision. Thank you.
11
              COMMISSIONER ROBERTS: Yes, thank you. I -- I
12
    really appreciate both presentations. Kind of gives us
13
    a -- an up-to-date snapshot of where we're at in trying
14
    to project the future. But, yeah, I'd definitely
15
    recommend and hope that we can convene again in person
16
    and hopefully get another update on the current
17
    financial situation of the state to make an informed
18
    decision. Thank you.
              COMMISSIONER HORROCKS: I echo the comments of
19
20
    my other commissioners. We're in limbo at the moment
21
    until we figure out this budget situation. But there's
22
    a lot of really good information presented today and we
23
    appreciate that.
2.4
              CHAIR SWEET: Let me ask -- we generally have
25
    a sense from people of availability. But if -- if the
```

```
idea was to do the June meeting in person, it would have
 1
    to be before the 18th, correct?
 3
              COMMISSIONER WONG:
                                  Yes.
 4
              CHAIR SWEET: A requirement. Okay.
 5
              So I guess what we'll -- we'll do, we're not
    going to do the whole thing now with our phones and all,
 6
    but I'll ask staff to poll people.
              Several considerations. One is I think the
 8
 9
    desire to have everyone in person. Two is the
10
    availability of space. And as I fall back on having one
    person the possibility of doing a telephonic meeting
11
12
    under the new rules, and Sarah will have two months to
13
    figure out how to make sure that we stay within those
14
    rules.
15
              But I -- I think the first -- the first option
16
    would be preferable to see if we can find a -- a
17
    mutually-agreeable date, that there is a room available
18
    for us either here or somewhere accessible to everyone.
19
    So I'll ask staff to do that and I'll ask the
20
    commissioners to keep their eyes open for emails polling
21
    you on dates, and please be responsive.
22
              COMMISSIONER WONG: Yes.
23
              CHAIR SWEET: Any -- any other thoughts on --
2.4
    on process before we move on?
25
              COMMISSIONER WONG: Do we have to make a
```

```
decision by June?
                       Is it a deadline, that we have to
 1
    make a decision, right?
 3
              CHAIR SWEET: Sarah, what's our constitutional
 4
    obligation?
 5
              MS. COHEN: By June 30th.
 6
              COMMISSIONER WONG:
                                  Okay.
 7
              CHAIR SWEET: Very good. So with that we have
    one more item on the agenda, and I'll ask staff to
 8
 9
    introduce, and I can provide a little bit of a -- a
10
    little bit of a -- some background.
              MS. SNARR: So the last item on the agenda is
11
12
    the presentation by the Legislative Analyst's Office
13
    regarding the reduction and responsibilities of the
14
    State Board of Education following passage of the
15
    taxpayer transparent --
16
              CHAIR SWEET: Equalization.
17
              MS. SNARR: -- Equalization, yes.
18
              -- following the passage of the Taxpayer
19
    Transparency and Fairness Act of 2017, and approval of a
20
    request for a legal opinion from the California Attorney
21
    General on the authority of the California Citizens
22
    Compensation Commission to reduce the base pay of BOE
23
    members commensurate with their reduced
2.4
    responsibilities.
25
              CHAIR SWEET: So I'll -- let me provide a
```

```
little bit of background and -- and then explain kind of
 1
    where -- where I'd like this to go at least for -- for
 3
    today's purpose.
 4
              The -- in 2017 the legislature passed and the
 5
    governor signed legislation that changed the roll of the
    BOE and pushed a lot of their responsibilities -- the
 6
    responsibilities they -- they'd had out to -- out of --
 8
    out of the board's purview.
 9
              The result was a -- to my understanding --
10
    we'll hear from LAO in a second. To my understanding it
    was a -- a pretty significant reduction in the
11
12
    responsibilities of these elected officials.
              The reason I've asked for this to -- this was
13
14
    brought to my attention by someone who was involved in
15
    that whole process. I've -- I've asked that we have a
16
    conversation about it because it's my understanding that
17
    the BOE's within our -- within the agencies that we --
18
    that we decide on an increase for.
19
              And the question that -- that I -- I asked was
20
    are we able to and should we evaluate those salaries and
21
    can we -- can we do anything going the other direction
22
    or is it even inappropriate to do so.
23
              So I -- I thought -- so this would be a -- a
24
    two -- a two-piece process. The first piece is to get
25
    some background on what happened in 2017 and what the
```

```
role is and how it has changed. And we'll have
 1
    presentation on that in a minute.
 3
              And then the next step, should we be
    interested in engaging this discussion will be -- would
 4
 5
    be to ask for an opinion from the attorney general's
    office about if this is even somewhere we can go.
 6
              So that's -- that's where we are. And with
 7
    that I'd -- I'd invite the presentation. And then we
 8
 9
    can open it to discussion afterwards.
10
              COMMISSIONER THOMPSON: And before we start it
    sounds like you're referring to -- I'm looking at the
11
12
    resolution -- the BOE members who we're currently paying
13
    one thousand -- $175,576. Is that correct?
14
              CHAIR SWEET: That's correct.
15
              COMMISSIONER THOMPSON: Thank you.
16
              CHAIR SWEET: And that's under tab -- what is
17
    that, five, four, five?
18
              COMMISSIONER THOMPSON: Resolution June 22nd,
19
    2023.
20
              COMMISSIONER WONG: So involve one member?
21
    Involve just one member?
22
              CHAIR SWEET: It's five, right?
23
              COMMISSIONER WONG: Five members?
2.4
              CHAIR SWEET: Go ahead.
25
              MR. UHLER: (Unintelligible).
```

```
1
              CHAIR SWEET:
                            Please.
 2
              MR. UHLER: Good afternoon. I'm Brian Uhler
 3
    with the Legislative Analyst's Office. And I'm here
    today to present some information on the 2017 changes at
 4
 5
    the Board of Equalization.
              Before getting in to that I wanted to give a
 6
    little bit of context just on the state's tax system and
    some institutional background on BOE, and then summarize
 8
 9
    the changes that were made in 2017.
10
              (Pause)
11
              CHAIR SWEET: You might be working without a
12
    net.
13
              MR. UHLER: Okay, that's fine. Having the
14
    slides are just maybe for your future reference anyway.
15
              So the state's tax system really has four
16
    major tax revenue sources, income taxes, corporation
17
    taxes, sales tax, and property tax.
18
              Income tax and corporation taxes are
19
    exclusively state revenue sources. The property tax is
20
    exclusively a local government revenue source. Sales
21
    tax is -- some of it goes to the state and some of it to
22
    local government.
23
              In addition to those big (unintelligible)
2.4
    there's a variety of other smaller taxes including taxes
25
    on alcohol and insurance companies. The state's tax
```

```
system -- implementation of the state's tax system can
 1
    kind of be broken out in to two broad categories and
 3
    activities.
 4
              One, is (unintelligible) so that's everything
 5
    from taxpayer education (unintelligible). Receiving tax
    returns and payments to enforcing taxes
 6
    (unintelligible). So that's the tax administration
    side.
 8
              The tax fuel side is when there's a
 9
10
    disagreement between the taxpayer and the administering
11
    agency about how much taxes are owed.
12
              And the taxpayer can appeal that. They first
13
    start by appealing to the administrative agency itself.
14
    The next step is to go to a quasi-judicial government
15
    body. And then the final step in some cases is to take
16
    those appeals to the courts. So this tax system is
17
    implemented by a handful of state agencies, the Board of
18
    Equalization being one of those.
19
              The Board of Equalization was established by
20
    voters in the constitution around 150 years ago. In its
21
    current form it has five members. Four of them are --
22
    there we go -- four of them are elected through district
23
    elections, and the fifth is the state controller.
2.4
              The BOE was originally established to address
25
    inconsistent property tax assessment practices across
```

```
Over the years it's responsibilities were
 1
    counties.
    expanded both through statute and through voter changes
 3
    to the constitution.
 4
              In addition to property taxes the
 5
    constitutional responsibilities were expanded over time
    to include alcohol taxes and insurance taxes as well.
 6
              So this -- this chart here shows
 7
    responsibilities for implementing the state's tax system
 8
 9
    prior to the 2017 changes. And what you can see is that
10
    in addition to its constitutional responsibilities over
11
    property, alcohol, and insurance taxes BOE also
12
    administered several other taxes including the sales tax
13
    and was also responsible for serving as the
14
    quasi-judicial government -- governing body for appeals
15
    on all the taxes it administered plus the income tax and
16
    corporation tax which were administered by the Franchise
17
    Tax Board.
              So this kind of broad scope of BOE's pre 2017
18
19
    responsibilities combined with its institutional
20
    structure raised some issues about its ability to sort
21
    of effectively carry out all of its objectives. And
22
    part of the concern was that prior to 2017 BOE blended
23
    elements of the legislative, executive, and judicial
    branchs all in sort of one entity.
2.4
25
              This raised some concerns from many
```

```
organizations including our office dating back several
 1
    decades.
              For example, issues about the extent to which
 3
    the board's actions in serving their quasi-judicial role
    really reflected things that should be elements of the
 4
 5
    legislative or executive process as well as concerns
    about whether the fact that the Board members were
 6
    elected through district elections led them to focus on
    issues that were particularly relevant to their district
 8
 9
    which had issues with creating lack of uniformity in --
10
    in their operations and their -- and their rule making.
11
              Outside of our office and -- and more recently
12
    in 2015 the controller -- the controller's audit of BOE
13
    found issues with their accounting practices.
14
    2017 a Department of Finance evaluation found several
15
    issues including improper redirection of
16
    revenue-generating resources to -- for a number of
17
    activities. So because of these longstanding concerns
18
    in 2017 legislation was enacted to narrow the scope of
19
    the Board of Equalization's responsibilities.
20
              In short, the -- the legislation essentially
21
    narrowed down the Board of Equalization's
22
    responsibilities to those that are -- that is taxed
23
    within the constitution and removed all of them that had
24
    been placed statutorily so that the legislature can
25
    change without going back to the voters.
```

```
1
              So this -- the BOE statutory responsibilities
 2
    were assigned to two new state agencies.
 3
    administrative responsibilities over all taxes outside
 4
    of property, insurance, and alcohol (unintelligible) to
 5
    the California Department of Tax and Fee Administration.
    In their appeals authority over, again, all the taxes
 6
    other than property, and alcohol, and insurance were
    shifted to a new office of tax appeals.
 8
 9
              So this chart now shows there is sort of a
10
    responsibility landscape after the reform. And you can
11
    see there down at the bottom that BOE is now just
12
    strictly limited to the -- tasked with the
13
    responsibilities that are assigned to it in the state
14
    constitution while the other taxes are handled by these
15
    other state agencies.
16
              Sort of consistent with this narrowing
17
    staffing at BOE has declined significantly prior to the
              They had over 4,000 staff at BOE and now it's
18
19
    a little under 200. And by some estimates the boards of
20
    appeals workload has decreased by around 95 percent
21
    following the 2017 changes.
22
              So that concludes my presentation and I'm
23
    happy to take questions.
2.4
              COMMISSIONER THOMPSON: Thank you. Can we flip
   between four and seven?
25
```

```
MR. UHLER: Yep. No, sorry, four?
 1
              COMMISSIONER THOMPSON:
                                      And seven again.
 3
              Oh, I'll take a look at a printed copy.
    want to see them side by side.
 4
              MR. UHLER: Yeah, it probably would have been
 5
    good to print them side by side.
 6
 7
              COMMISSIONER THOMPSON: That's fine.
              You mentioned that their work had estimated to
 8
 9
    have reduced by 95 percent. Who estimated that?
10
              MR. UHLER: I think that's some prior
    estimates from our office as part of the considerations
11
12
    for (unintelligible).
13
              COMMISSIONER THOMPSON: Sure.
                                             Okay, thank
14
    you.
15
              COMMISSIONER HORROCKS: Do you know if that 95
16
    percent reduction, is that based on the staffing, is
17
    that based on the dollars that --
              MR. UHLER: I think it's . . . I'll --
18
19
    I'll -- I'll make sure I circle back with your staff to
2.0
    confirm. But I believe it was based on a review of
21
    essentially looking at their agendas pre and post, like
22
    the number of items and appeals that they were hearing
23
    at the Board.
2.4
              COMMISSIONER HORROCKS:
                                      Thank you.
25
              COMMISSIONER WONG: Well, obviously this is a
```

```
significant decrease. So this is important for us to
 1
    find out, you know, how this is being arrived, 95 and
 3
    five.
 4
              MR. UHLER: I -- I will -- as I said, I will
 5
    follow up with staff to provide some clarity on that.
 6
              COMMISSIONER THOMPSON:
                                     (Unintelligible) I
    will say this was very informative. Thank you, Brian,
    for presenting this. And I hope that CalHR can maybe
 8
 9
    prepare something for all the positions that we cover,
10
    not this robust, but maybe just a brief overview.
              COMMISSIONER HORROCKS: I have one more
11
12
    question. Sorry.
13
              The Office of Tax Appeals, that is not an
14
    appointed position, correct?
15
              MR. UHLER: Appointed? I -- I mean I think --
16
    let's see. They have a -- like an executive director
17
    that -- that is appointed but not -- no -- not elected.
18
              COMMISSIONER HORROCKS: Elected, thank you.
19
    So they would not be in what we -- what we're voting on?
20
              Perfect. Thank you.
21
              CHAIR SWEET: What -- what are the current
22
    responsibilities then of a member of the Board of
23
    Equalization? Do they sit -- do they sit on these
24
    appeals panels?
25
              MR. UHLER: Well, appeals for property,
```

```
alcohol, and insurance tax issues, it's primarily
 1
    property tax issues. They do, you know, some rule
 3
    making in those areas, again, primarily property taxes.
    I think it's -- it -- it really is mostly about property
 4
 5
    tax appeals, assessment appeals, those sorts of issues.
              CHAIR SWEET: And -- and those are only if
 6
 7
    they roll up from the county, right?
                          Um . . . Yes. And also the Board
 8
              MR. UHLER:
 9
    of Equalization does have -- so you're correct, most
10
    property tax administration is handled at the county
           There is an appeals process for county-assessed
11
    level.
12
    properties. Those can roll up to the Board of
13
    Equalization.
14
              There are a limited set of properties that
15
    are -- that are assessed directly by the Board of
16
    Equalization. Those are things like utility
17
    infrastructure, pipelines, things that cross over county
18
    borders, railroads and things like that. So those
19
    appeals can come directly to the Board as well.
20
    Board members do have responsibilities for taxpayer
21
    outreach and education and those sorts of activities.
22
              COMMISSIONER THOMPSON:
                                      I have a question.
23
              Is there any public annual report or
2.4
    something? Can we look at their volume and how it's
25
    shifted year over year particularly since 2017?
```

```
I'm not sure about an annual
 1
              MR. UHLER:
 2
             I think we had some of that information that --
    report.
 3
    again, I could follow up with that.
 4
              COMMISSIONER THOMPSON: I think it would be
 5
    helpful to see how their work has changed over time by
    the numbers.
 6
 7
              CHAIR SWEET: Additional question or comment
    for Brian?
 8
              COMMISSIONER HORROCKS: I don't know that this
 9
10
    is for Brian, necessarily. But how do we as a
    Commission get notified that there's a change in scope
11
12
    faster than seven years after it's happened?
13
              CHAIR SWEET: We -- we need to work on that
14
    for sure.
15
              So does anyone have anything else for Brian at
16
    this point?
17
              COMMISSIONER ROBERTS:
                                     Thank you, Brian.
18
              CHAIR SWEET: Thanks a lot.
19
              I'm glad we got your slides. And if you could
20
    provide to staff and we'll -- and, in fact, for staff if
21
    you could get us all the slides we've seen today, that
22
    would be fantastic. I know they came together probably
23
    later than the agenda packages went out. But I think it
2.4
    will be helpful. There's a lot of information here.
25
              So the -- the question to the commissioners is
```

```
is this something that we want to continue to look at.
 1
    And I think if we did, we've -- we've spoken with our
 3
    general counsel and maybe I could ask Ms. Cohen to
    explain where we would go and -- and how you would --
 4
 5
    would advise us to do that if this is something that --
    that we want to explore.
 6
              MR. COHEN: Sure.
                                 The Commission would take a
 7
    vote to empower the -- the Chair to request an opinion,
 9
    in the Opinion Unit of the attorney general's office.
10
    That could happen today.
              And then from there -- and the resolution
11
12
    would also enable the Chair to work directly with the
13
    staff to help prepare that letter. And then the letter
14
    goes, you know, to the attorney general's office. And,
15
    you know, there's no quarantee it will be available by
16
    the time you meet to decide the resolution this year.
17
    But we'll track it. And we'll work with the attorney
18
    general's office to make sure, you know, that we will
19
    get what you need to -- to -- to address the issue.
20
              CHAIR SWEET: Can you frame the -- the
21
    question, please, in terms of what -- what -- kind of
22
    what we need? Because I -- as I -- we discussed this,
23
    right, as I recall. We are to vote on increases but,
24
    you know, I think that generally the question is can we
25
    vote on a decrease and what -- how -- what is that.
```

```
Right. So, you know, basically
 1
              MR. COHEN:
    the constitution -- the language of the constitution
 3
    from nineteen -- you know, the 1990 proposition is that
 4
    the Commission shall first establish and then annually
 5
    adjust the salary of all the various, you know, elected
    officials in the State of California.
 6
 7
              So the question that will be put to the
    Attorney General's Opinion Unit is the extent of the
 8
 9
    authority to re-examine essentially the base pay and
10
    reduce the salary, the compensation and benefits, of the
11
    BOE members commensurate with the reduction in
12
    responsibilities that were brought about by this
13
    legislation in 2017.
14
              So it would be asking the attorney general's
    office to opine, essentially, on the extent of the
15
16
    authority of the Commission to take that kind of action.
17
    It's never been -- you know, it's never had to address
    before and never had to do before. So this seems like
18
19
    it would be a good idea to, you know, have some kind of
20
    North Star in terms of quidance from the attorney
21
    general's office as to how to proceed.
22
              If this were to go to litigation, the courts,
23
    the attorney general's opinion would have deference.
                                                           Ιt
24
    wouldn't be dispositive. But it would be a helpful
25
    place to start.
```

```
COMMISSIONER THOMPSON: That sounds like we
 1
    need clarity on the word adjust.
 3
              MR. COHEN: Correct. Right. Because I think
    the constitutional language, you know, assumed that
 4
 5
    there would be one establishment at the very beginning
    and then annual adjustments thereby.
 6
 7
              And correct me if I'm wrong, staff, but since
    the beginning of the Commission the annual adjustments
 8
 9
    have applied pretty much, you know, across the board and
10
    have not really focused on a particular agency that
    may -- or a particular appointed office that may have
11
12
    changed over the course of time.
13
              So I really appreciate your question,
14
    Commissioner Horrocks. Because how do you find out
15
    about these kinds of changes over the course of, you
16
    know, time. I -- good question for the Chair.
17
              COMMISSIONER WONG: So I assume that we cannot
18
    do any retroactive.
              MR. COHEN: No. I -- I don't believe the
19
20
    constitution contemplates a retroactive adjustment in
21
    salaries. But -- but I believe that at one time in the
22
    course of the history the Commission there may have been
23
    kind of a -- I think this was early on, the legislature,
2.4
    a -- a freeze until they were caught up to where they
25
    felt they needed to be.
```

```
So there -- I mean, there's not just one thing
 1
    the Commission can do. The Commission can freeze it,
 3
    the Commission can reduce it. And the question is, you
    know, how to interpret the language to accomplish that
 4
 5
    in this particular setting where the structure, the
    organization of the entity, has changed since beginning
 6
    of, you know, the creation the Commission.
 8
              COMMISSIONER HORROCKS: I have a question
 9
    about the Board itself. Do we have any -- is it
10
    required to have five members as part of the Board or
11
    can we adjust that expectation?
12
              MR. COHEN: I believe that's a constitutional
13
    requirement that there be five members, one, the
14
    controller, and then the four elected from the
15
    districts.
16
              So, you know, in the same vein that only the
17
    statutorily-created duties got transferred to these
18
    other state agencies and the Board of Equalization was
19
    left with its constitutional response -- limited
20
    constitutional responsibilities. The same thing with
21
    the composition. I don't think those are the kinds of
22
    things that you can touch. But you certainly have
23
    jurisdiction over compensation of the members.
2.4
              COMMISSIONER HORROCKS:
                                      Thank you.
25
              MR. COHEN: And just to point out that the
```

```
controller is a -- I mean, the controller is separately
 1
    under your jurisdiction as well. So there are the four
 3
    members of the Board of Equalization. Controller is a
    member but also the controller is an independent
 4
 5
    position as well.
              COMMISSIONER WONG: So if there's any
 6
    reduction on the -- on the BOE, would not -- can -- can
    be not applied to the controller?
 8
 9
              MR. COHEN: Well, it -- right. If the -- the
10
    controller's responsibilities were not thereby, you
    know, reduced as a result of the legislation, those are
11
12
    issues that you really do need to explore and see how
13
    that -- how that might have been affected by the change
14
    in legislation.
15
              COMMISSIONER WONG: Thank you.
16
              CHAIR SWEET: So my -- my thinking is as
17
    follows.
18
              I -- certainly -- well, we're not in a hurry
19
    to do this. This is not -- we -- we have to -- we're
20
    not on a clock, right, but this is something that I
    became aware of and, you know, to your point this is the
21
22
    kind of thing that, you know, seems like we should know
23
    about and we should think about.
2.4
              And in discussions with staff and with counsel
25
    it became clear that -- that to me at least that this is
```

```
not the kind of thing that we wanted to just -- just go
 1
             I'm not sure we can. I think -- my view is we
 3
    should ask the question. And -- and then once we have
    an answer to the question can we -- we can get to should
 4
 5
    we. And -- and how we, right?
              I mean, you've got -- you have people who are
 6
    in elective office who have an expectation. You know,
    maybe it's the kind of thing that, you know, our -- our
 8
 9
    decision is, you know -- people who were elected
10
    subsequent to some date or something like this, right?
              This is -- this is not a hot-button issue, but
11
12
    I think in terms of good government and -- and our
13
    responsibilities it's something that we should explore
14
    and potentially move on, if not, you know, this year in,
15
    you know -- in the near future to get -- and but first
    get some clarity on -- on what we can -- what we can do.
16
17
              So going back to what I -- what I think the
18
    action item would be today, Ms. Cohen, it would be a
19
    resolution allowing and directing me to work with staff
20
    to request the opinion?
21
              MR. COHEN: That's correct. Yeah.
22
              CHAIR SWEET: And then --
23
              MR. COHEN: It would be essentially resolved
2.4
    that the Commission directs the Chair to request a
25
    letter from the attorney general's office on the
```

```
authority of the Commission in this area, not word for
 1
    word, and then with the assistance of Commission staff
 3
    as needed. And I think that you could vote on a
 4
    resolution along that, you know -- along those lines.
   And that would be sufficient.
 5
              COMMISSIONER THOMPSON: (Unintelligible) a
 6
 7
   motion?
 8
              (Speaking over each other)
 9
              CHAIR SWEET: Okay, Commissioner Thompson.
10
              COMMISSIONER THOMPSON: Yeah, a motion to
    approve a request for legal opinion from the California
11
12
    Attorney General on the authority of the California
13
    Citizens Compensation Commission to reduce the base pay
14
    of BOE members commensurate with their reduced
15
    responsibilities.
16
              CHAIR SWEET: Excellent. Very well done.
17
              MR. COHEN:
                          I'm sorry, can I just interrupt
18
    for a second.
19
              And would you like to add to that with the
20
    assistance of Commission staff as needed so that it
21
    is -- it encompasses the entire approval?
22
              COMMISSIONER THOMPSON: As long as I don't
23
   have to say it all over.
2.4
              MR. COHEN: No.
              COMMISSIONER THOMPSON: With the inclusion of
25
```

1	Commission staff.
2	MR. COHEN: Thank you.
3	CHAIR SWEET: Thank you, Commissioner
4	Thompson.
5	Is there a second?
6	COMMISSIONER WONG: I'll second.
7	COMMISSIONER ROBERTS: I'll second.
8	CHAIR SWEET: Commissioner Roberts.
9	Is there discussion of the motion?
10	COMMISSIONER HORROCKS: Motion to approve.
11	CHAIR SWEET: Okay, we have the motion. We
12	have a second.
13	And I'll ask staff to call the roll.
14	MS. SNARR: Laura Horrocks.
15	COMMISSIONER HORROCKS: Aye.
16	MS. SNARR: Darrell Roberts?
17	COMMISSIONER ROBERTS: Aye.
18	MS. SNARR: Tyren Thompson.
19	COMMISSIONER THOMPSON: Aye.
20	MS. SNARR: Margaret Wong.
21	COMMISSIONER WONG: Aye.
22	MS. SNARR: And Michael Sweet.
23	CHAIR SWEET: Aye.
24	We at 2:47 have nothing additional on the
25	agenda. I will use this opportunity to provide a

1	reminder to the commissioners that we have an obligation		
2	to file with the FPPC Form 700s no later than April 1st.		
3	And emails came in with that information, and staff		
4	will will assist if you haven't seen the email or if		
5	you have questions.		
6	And with that unless we have anything else		
7	I'll entertain a motion to adjourn.		
8	Commissioner Horrocks.		
9	COMMISSIONER HORROCKS: Motion to adjourn.		
10	CHAIR SWEET: Is there a second?		
11	COMMISSIONER ROBERTS: Second.		
12	CHAIR SWEET: Any opposition?		
13	Then by unanimous consent this meeting is		
14	adjourned at 2:48. Thanks everyone.		
15	COMMISSIONER WONG: Thank you.		
16	COMMISSIONER THOMPSON: Thank you.		
17	COMMISSIONER HORROCKS: Thank you.		
18			
19	000		
20			
21			
22			
23			
24			
25			

1	CERTIFICATE OF CERTIFIED SHORTHAND REPORTER		
2			
3	000		
4			
5	I, DONNA K. NICHOLS, a Certified Shorthand Reporte		
6	in and for the state of California, duly commissioned		
7	and a disinterested person, certify;		
8	That the foregoing pages were transcribed from		
9	digital recording;		
10	That the statements of all parties made on the digital		
11	recording were thereafter transcribed into typewriting		
12	by me to the best of my ability;		
13	That the foregoing transcript is a record of the		
14	audible statements of all parties made on the digital		
15	recording.		
16			
17	Dated: April 23, 2024		
18			
19	Dænna K. Nichola		
20	DONNA K. NICHOLS, RPR, CSR STATE OF CALIFORNIA		
21	CSR NO. 5660		
22			
23			
24			
25			

CALIFORNIA CITIZENS COMPENSATION COMMISSION Meeting held 3-12-24 Transcript on 03/12/2024

•	2019/'20 28:2	50 21:22
\$	2022 18:10 27:13	50/50 19:4 23:8
\$175,576 41:13	2023 3:13 4:21 9:18,19 10:1,3,6 41:19	500 35:6
1	2024 10:3 27:5	7
1.2 35:5	205,000 13:7 22:3	7 19:17
1.3 30:2 32:1	208.7 28:15	700s 59:2
1.8 35:9	21 13:4,5	
	21/'22 28:2	8
10 27:2	22 3:12 9:10	9 7.22
107,000 22:2,4	22nd 6:5 41:18	8 7:23
12.2 29:4	23 9:10 28:7	8,500 22:21
13 13:8	23/'24 28:25	9
13.1 34:21	24 18:24	
15 7:25 19:24	24/'25 25:25 28:6,16 29:25	9.6 28:24
150 43:20	25 7:21	900 29:6
17/'18 20:8	250,000 13:22	95 46:20 47:9,15 48:2
18.4 33:3 34:4	252,000 14:3 21:6	Α
18.8 33:24 34:10,19	291.5 27:6	A
18th 6:5 38:2	2:47 58:24	abide 6:18
19 33:14	2:48 59:14	ability 44:20
1990 10:6 52:3		accessible 38:18
1:30 2:1	3	accomplish 54:4
1F 29:19	30th 39:5	account 23:11 29:6 32:21
1st 18:24 23:23 30:16 31:1 59:2	37.9 27:8	accounting 45:13
2		accounts 33:4 34:7
	4	act 19:3 28:7 31:11 39:19
2,700 14:5 15:15	4,000 46:18	action 10:5 52:16 56:18
2.5 30:1	,	actions 45:3
2.9 35:4	4.5 28:8	active 16:5
20 16:22 33:14	4.8 30:8	activities 43:3 45:17 49:21
200 46:19	40 8:16	actual 11:3 14:16 15:9 33:20
2009 29:19	400 14:9	add 21:8 57:19
2010 10:1,3	450,000 21:10	added 11:7 36:6
2015 45:12	47,000 13:20	addition 13:14 16:3 22:14 42:23
2016/'17 20:7	5	44:4,10
2017 39:19 40:4,25 42:4,9 44:9,18,		additional 15:24 28:19 35:10 50: 58:24

Index: \$175,576..additional

Meeting held 3-12-24 Transcript on 03/12/2024 Index: address..board address 2:25 3:5 17:2 43:24 51:19 annualize 11:23 availability 37:25 38:10 52:17 annually 52:4 aware 55:21 adjourn 59:7,9 **Anthony** 12:21 25:23 37:8 **Ave** 4:5,7 58:15,17,19,21,23 adjourned 59:14 apologies 2:19 В adjust 52:5 53:2 54:11 appeal 43:12 adjusting 6:8 appealing 43:13 back 21:13 22:7 24:14 27:24 28:12 adjustment 17:4,5,7 36:8 53:20 34:16 38:10 45:1,25 47:19 56:17 **appeals** 43:16 44:14 46:6,8,20 adjustments 16:25 17:20 18:3 47:22 48:13,24,25 49:5,11,19 background 39:10 40:1,25 42:8 23:12 24:18 53:6.8 applied 53:9 55:8 balance 29:2 administered 44:12,15,16 appointed 8:21 48:14,15,17 53:11 balanced 27:6 administering 43:10 approval 39:19 57:21 **bargaining** 12:13,23 13:4,5,10,16 administration 43:7 46:5 49:10 15:1 16:18 17:6,18,25 18:7,12,23 approve 3:20,22 57:11 58:10 19:7,9,12,16,20 20:7,9,15,17 21:17 administrative 43:13 46:3 Approved 4:3,9 23:6,22 25:1,17 26:3,8 adoption 3:10 approving 35:18 **base** 10:24 11:5 15:24 22:14,18,19 advise 25:16,20 51:5 24:18 39:22 52:9 57:13 approximately 13:7 28:24 30:2 affect 33:6 36:19 based 13:6 14:18 27:9 30:16 31:1 April 59:2 47:16,17,20 affected 33:8 55:13 area 8:5 57:1 basically 52:1 afraid 34:8 areas 49:3 **basis** 15:1 afternoon 2:1 7:17 26:19,21 42:2 argument 31:22 beain 6:2 agencies 40:17 43:17 46:2,15 arrive 30:14 54:18 beginning 7:1 53:5,8 54:6 arrived 48:2 agency 28:21 43:11,13 53:10 benefit 9:20 15:5 assessed 49:15 agenda 2:21 9:8 26:15 39:8,11 benefits 10:4 15:11 16:6 23:9 50:23 58:25 assessment 43:25 49:5 52:10 agendas 47:21 assigned 46:2,13 biannual 15:1 aggregate 28:14 assist 59:4 **big** 27:18,24 32:9 33:13 42:23 agree 37:6 assistance 57:2,20 **billion** 27:6.8 28:16 29:5 30:1.7.8 33:3,24 34:21 35:4,5,9 ahead 7:16 11:15 41:24 assistants 14:13 binder 9:6,17 10:15 alcohol 42:25 44:6,11 46:4,7 49:1 assume 53:17 binders 3:13 allowed 25:19 assumed 53:4 bit 5:4 6:9 20:19 25:5 39:9.10 40:1 allowing 8:9 56:19 Aston 26:21 35:12 37:8 42:7 alluded 17:13 attending 2:23 4:20 black 28:5,7 amendments 3:17 attention 27:25 40:14 blanking 32:23 amount 29:25 34:20 35:9 attorney 8:24 39:20 41:5 51:9,14, blended 44:22 17 52:8,14,20,23 56:25 57:12 amounts 11:17,18,19 19:13 BLS 15:10,17 attrition 14:18 Analyst's 39:12 42:3

authority 13:16 31:14 39:21 46:6

audit 45:12

52:9,16 57:1,12

annual 28:8,9 35:17 49:23 50:1

53:6,8

blue 28:6.8

board 8:5 39:14 42:5 43:17.19

44:17 45:6,19,21 47:23 48:22 49:8,

12,15,19,20 53:9 54:9,10,18 55:3

board's 40:8 45:3

boards 46:19

body 43:15 44:14

BOE 39:22 40:6 41:12 42:8 43:24 44:11,22 45:12 46:1,11,17,18 52:11 55:7 57:14

BOE's 40:17 44:18

borders 49:18

borrowing 29:4

bottom 46:11

branch 13:24 21:9

branchs 44:24

breakdown 27:20

Brian 42:2 48:7 50:8,10,15,17

bringing 4:25

broad 43:2 44:18

broken 43:2

brought 40:14 52:12

budget 26:17 27:1,5,6,14 28:6,7, 16,25 29:2,6,25 30:11 34:21 35:3 36:18 37:21

bullet 16:7 29:10

Bureau 15:4

business 8:18

byproduct 5:11

C

cadence 36:4

calculates 15:8

Calhr 12:22 13:2,16 15:8 48:8

Calhr's 14:24

California 7:19,20,23,25 12:12 15:7 20:25 21:5 26:16 39:20,21 46:5 52:6 57:11,12

call 3:8 4:12 9:2 12:9 16:24 17:5 22:16 26:14 27:18,25 35:14 58:13

care 16:5 20:4 23:8,10 29:9

carry 44:21 cases 43:15 cash 33:6

catch 12:7

categories 43:2

caught 53:24

caused 33:15

certification 10:8 30:23

certify 29:22

Chair 2:1,15,17 3:12,21,24 4:11,14 6:21 7:3,6,9 8:2,20,21 10:12,19 11:4,12,14 12:4,6,16,20 20:23 22:6,19,23 24:12 25:3,15 26:11,14 30:19 31:9,16 32:6 35:10,14,20 37:24 38:4,23 39:3,7,16,25 41:14, 16,22,24 42:1,11 48:21 49:6 50:7, 13,18 51:8,12,20 53:16 55:16 56:22,24 57:9,16 58:3,8,11,23 59:10,12

Chair's 4:13 9:2

Chairman 36:21

challenges 17:2

change 30:11,15 45:25 50:11

55:13

changed 40:5 41:1 50:5 53:12

54:6

changing 6:7,8

charge 29:17

chart 10:5 13:10 17:17 18:21,25 19:6,17 20:10 21:23 24:8,9 33:11 44:7 46:9

check 7:1 21:2

CHP 26:1

Chula 7:19

circle 47:19

circulated 3:14

cities 17:15

Citizens 39:21 57:13

city 9:22

Civil 10:2

clarify 13:23

clarity 48:5 53:2 56:16

classification 14:5,10 17:8,11 24:23

classifications 13:11,12 14:6

Index: board's..companies

15:15 17:1

clear 55:25

clearance 36:5

climate 35:4

clock 3:2 55:20

close 3:7

closely 15:4 28:18

closer 5:8

Cohen 4:19 6:16,17,25 7:4,8 39:5 51:3,7 52:1 53:3,19 54:12,25 55:9 56:18,21,23 57:17,24 58:2

collective 12:13,23 13:10,15 17:18 19:9 20:16 23:6

column 20:6,12 22:9 23:22 24:8

combination 33:4 34:3

combined 44:19

commensurate 39:23 52:11

57:14

comment 2:22 3:1,3,7 50:7

comments 10:14 37:19

commission 2:24 3:1,6,8,14,17 7:7 8:22,23,25 10:5 11:15 12:9 26:23 27:4 30:21 32:7 39:22 50:11 51:7 52:4,16 53:8,22 54:2,3,7 56:24 57:1,2,13,20 58:1

Commission's 29:16

commissioner 2:5,7,9,11,13,16 3:20,21,23,24 4:3,5,7,9 7:13,17 8:2,3,8,15 9:11,16 10:16 11:16,20, 23 12:1,3 20:23,24 21:3,12,13,16, 24 22:5 23:1,13,20,24 24:1,11,13 25:16,22,23 26:10 31:18,25 32:5,8, 16,17 33:5,10,11,18,22,23 34:2,6, 10,14,22,23 35:10 36:6,15 37:5,11, 19 38:3,22,25 39:6 41:10,15,18,20, 23 46:24 47:2,7,13,15,24,25 48:6, 11,18 49:22 50:4,9,17 53:1,14,17 54:8,24 55:6,15 57:6,9,10,22,25 58:3,6,7,8,10,15,17,19,21 59:8,9, 11,15,16,17

commissioners 3:18 4:23 5:5 6:22 10:13 12:20 36:2,11 37:20 38:20 50:25 59:1

companies 42:25

comparable 15:12 contracts 18:8 D compared 18:11 contribute 18:15 23:8.12 comparer 31:20 **contributing** 19:13,24 20:7 dark 28:6 comparison 15:12 **contribution** 19:1,7,23 20:13 Darrell 2:6 4:4 7:18 58:16 compensation 5:22 12:13,23,24 contributions 16:4.5 19:2 20:3 dashed 28:7 14:25 15:9,18,24 16:8,9 18:14,18 controller 43:23 45:12 54:14 55:1, data 15:5,9,17 27:9 20:20 22:14,17 35:19 39:22 52:10 3,4,8 54:23 57:13 date 30:8 38:17 56:10 controller's 15:10 45:12 55:10 complete 15:3 dates 6:4,8 38:21 convene 6:22 37:15 completing 14:25 dating 45:1 **conversation** 30:12 40:16 composition 54:21 deadline 39:1 cooks 13:12 compressed 4:24 5:9 decades 27:25 45:2 copy 10:9 47:3 concern 44:22 decide 40:18 51:16 corner 28:1 concerns 44:25 45:5,17 deciding 36:20 corporate 27:19 conclude 9:2 decision 5:3,8 25:7,8 31:15 37:3, corporation 42:16,18 44:16 10,18 39:1,2 56:9 concludes 20:18 46:22 correct 6:16 7:8 22:25 33:25 35:21 decisions 4:23 22:1 conclusion 36:23 38:2 41:13,14 48:14 49:9 53:3,7 declined 46:17 condition 29:22 56:21 decrease 29:5 48:1 51:25 **conditions** 31:4,10,12 corrected 9:15 28:12 33:14 decreased 46:20 confidential 13:18 correcting 33:9 deep 37:2 confirm 47:20 correction 27:14 28:10 deference 52:23 conflicts 5:19 cost 15:19,20 19:4 23:9 deferrals 29:13 consent 59:13 costs 16:3 19:5 23:10 deficit 33:7 36:25 37:1 counsel 4:19 51:3 55:24 consequential 5:1 define 15:11 32:10 considerations 12:14 26:18 38:8 counties 44:1 47:11 delay 27:11 33:5 county 8:10 9:23 49:7,10,17 considered 6:17 delayed 27:12 county-assessed 49:11 consistent 11:1 19:2 23:6 46:16 delays 29:13 court 9:25 10:21 constitution 29:18 30:25 31:5 deliberate 5:6 courts 43:16 52:22 43:20 44:3 45:23 46:14 52:2 53:20 deliberations 27:4 **cover** 48:9 constitutional 10:4 25:9 31:3 deliberative 6:2 36:3 32:3 39:3 44:5,10 53:4 54:12,19,20 **COVID** 28:3 delivered 31:1 constitutionally 29:20 **Crawford** 12:15,17,21 21:1,7,15, 19 22:2,13,22,25 23:5,19,21 24:6, dental 16:6 contained 9:5 20 25:12,19 26:5,13 department 12:12 13:2 24:4 contemplates 53:20 creating 45:9 26:16,22 32:14,15 45:14 46:5 content 5:4 creation 54:7 departments 29:11 context 37:9,10 42:7 cross 49:17 **depend** 14:17 continue 28:11 51:1 current 19:23 20:13 32:2 37:16 depending 23:21 25:1

Index: comparable..depending

43:21 48:21

contract 13:3 18:13

Deputy 12:21 **ed** 21:8 entrepreneur 8:18 desire 38:9 education 14:2 27:22 28:17.18 **entry** 14:13 39:14 43:5 49:21 Development 28:21 **Equalization** 39:16,17 42:5 43:18, effect 7:1 19 48:23 49:9.13.16 54:18 55:3 difference 19:18 effective 18:23 Equalization's 45:19,21 differential 22:18 essential 29:12 effectively 44:21 differentials 15:25 17:12,14 22:15 eighteen 34:4 essentially 45:20 47:21 52:9,15 directing 56:19 56:23 elected 9:22.23 25:18 40:12 43:22 direction 40:21 45:7 48:17.18 52:5 54:14 56:9 establish 52:4 directly 49:15,19 51:12 **elections** 43:23 45:7 established 43:19,24 director 12:21 29:21 30:16 48:16 elective 56:7 establishment 53:5 directs 56:24 elements 44:23 45:4 estimated 47:8.9 disagreement 43:10 eleven-and-a-half 19:25 estimates 46:19 47:11 discuss 13:2 eligible 16:2.19.22 17:9 23:17 evaluate 40:20 discussed 51:22 24:19 evaluation 45:14 discussing 35:23 email 59:4 eventually 24:23 discussion 3:25 4:18 5:6 35:16 emails 38:20 59:3 exact 21:11 36:22 41:4.9 58:9 **employee** 12:22,24 13:9 15:8,23 examples 32:11 34:25 discussions 55:24 16:1,11 17:24 18:25 20:2,13,20 21:18 25:14 Excellent 57:16 dispositive 52:24 employee's 19:5 excluded 13:15.17.20 16:15 district 9:23 43:22 45:7.8 **employees** 13:5,14,15,17,18,20, exclusive 24:7 districts 54:15 23 14:1,13,16 16:15,18 17:8 18:3, exclusively 42:19,20 23 19:3,8,11 23:8,17 24:7,9 doctors 14:14 Excuse 9:11 employer 15:19 20:25 document 10:23 executive 10:2 13:24 44:23 45:5 employers 15:6 **DOF** 10:7 48:16 empower 51:8 dollars 35:1 47:17 exercise 4:23 5:21 **enable** 51:12 double 21:2 expanded 44:2,5 enacted 45:18 downward 28:4 expectation 54:11 56:7 drawing 29:6 encompasses 57:21 expenditures 27:7,21 28:15 29:14 due 14:18 end 5:1.8.13 18:19 30:19 32:9 enforcing 43:6 duties 54:17 explain 25:11 30:21 40:1 51:4 **engage** 36:12 explanation 25:5 Ε engaging 41:4 explore 51:6 55:12 56:13 **enjoy** 37:7 extend 8:11 16:14 earlier 5:5 36:1 enjoyed 23:14 extent 45:2 52:8.15 early 32:8 53:23 entertain 59:7 extra 7:4 earning 17:10 24:25 entire 14:12 57:21 eyes 38:20 echo 37:19 entity 44:24 54:6 economic 29:17,23 31:2

Index: Deputy..eyes

	five year 17:10	39:21 51:3 57:12
F	five-year 17:19	
feellthee of 5	flip 46:24 floor 36:13	general's 41:5 51:9,14,18 52:8,14, 21,23 56:25
facilities 35:5	flow 33:6	generally 16:8 37:24 51:24
facing 17:3	focus 29:11 45:7	gentlemen 36:17
fact 31:25 36:5 45:6 50:20	focused 53:10	geographic 15:25 17:14
factored 22:16	focuses 17:18	give 26:23 30:5 32:11 34:25 42:6
factors 18:19		glad 50:19
Fairness 39:19	follow 6:24 48:5 50:3	good 2:1,19,21 4:23 7:17 12:6,8
fall 14:4 16:20 38:10	Force 7:23	26:19,21 36:20 37:22 39:7 42:2
fantastic 50:22	forecast 27:10 33:9	47:6 52:19 53:16 56:12
faster 50:12	forecasting 33:8	Gov 28:22
fed 21:4	forget 34:3	governing 44:14
federal 15:4,16	form 17:4 43:21 59:2	government 13:7,24 28:21 42:20, 22 43:14 44:14 56:12
federally-defined 14:8 15:15	forms 15:24 16:9	
Fee 46:5	formulating 35:18	governor 13:3 40:5
feel 5:10	forward 31:4,13	governor's 27:1,5,14 28:6 29:25 30:11 34:20 35:3
felt 53:25	found 36:16 45:13,14	grayed 26:2
field 13:19	four-and-a-half 28:13	great 10:18 12:6
fifty 22:1,4	four-year 20:10	greater 8:4
figure 37:21 38:13	FPPC 59:2	green 18:1 24:17
file 21:22 59:2	frame 4:25 51:20	Greenhouse 35:8
filing 27:11 33:6	Franchise 44:16	group 17:1
fill 15:20	Francisco 8:21,25	groups 14:8,9 15:16
final 5:20 22:16 30:4,14,15,20 36:7	freeze 53:24 54:2	grow 28:11
43:15	front 9:6 21:19 24:20 33:19 37:2	growth 28:8,9
finally 29:13	fuel 43:9	guarantee 51:15
Finance 26:16,22 29:21 30:16	full 36:5	guess 3:2 28:23 34:12 38:5
45:14 financial 37:17	fund 28:15 29:17,23 30:3 31:2,8, 18,21 32:18 34:24 35:6,8	guidance 52:20
find 38:16 48:2 53:14	funding 23:7 35:7	ш
fine 42:13 47:7	future 27:20 29:14 37:14 42:14	
fire 14:21	56:15	half 19:14
firefighter 7:19		handful 43:17
firefighters 14:14,21,22 26:1	G	handled 46:14 49:10
FIS\$CAL 26:17	Gas 35:8	happen 51:10
fiscal 5:2,8,13 30:8	gave 35:20	happened 40:25 50:12
five-minute 3:2	general 16:17,23 17:23 18:2 24:19 28:14,15,21 30:2 31:7,21 35:8	happening 5:25

Index: facilities..happening

Meeting held 3-12-24 Transcript on 03/12/2024 Index: happy..kinds happy 8:14 20:21 30:18 46:23 implemented 43:17 intent 26:25 28:9 **health** 16:5,6 20:2,4 23:8,10 27:22 implementing 44:8 interest 12:25 28:17 32:10,12,14 important 27:8 30:22 37:1 48:1 interested 21:25 25:2 41:4 hear 2:13 12:15 26:19 40:10 improper 45:15 internal 29:3 heard 23:16 **in-person** 6:6,15 interpret 54:4 hearing 47:22 inaccurately 9:12 interrupt 57:17 helpful 12:3 36:16 50:5,24 52:24 inappropriate 40:22 introduce 7:14,15 39:9 **helps** 37:9 include 11:8.10 13:25 27:7 29:3 introduced 29:19 33:3 high-level 27:17 44:6 invite 36:10 41:8 high-tech 8:19 included 18:13,21 29:2,18 involve 41:20.21 higher 14:1 21:8 28:18 includes 15:22,23 27:6 28:20 involved 7:24 8:18 40:14 34:19 highlighted 18:1,6,9 19:10,16 issue 51:19 56:11 including 42:24 44:12 45:1,15 **history** 8:14 27:23 53:22 issues 2:24 44:20 45:2.8.9.13.15 inclusion 57:25 hold 5:16 49:1,2,5 55:12 income 27:18,19 42:16,18 44:15 home 7:20 16:12 item 2:21 3:9,10 4:12,13 9:3,4 inconsistent 43:25 12:9,10 17:12 26:14,15 29:18 hoops 7:4,7 35:14,16 39:8,11 56:18 increase 11:6,7 16:17,19,23 18:10 hope 5:17,19 20:19 37:15 48:8 24:21 29:9 40:18 **Horrocks** 2:4,5 3:20,21 4:2,3 8:2, increased 11:3 3,4 10:16 24:13 31:17,18,25 32:5 34:23 37:19 47:15,24 48:11,18 increases 10:22 11:17 16:13 50:9 53:14 54:8,24 58:10,14,15 17:20,23 18:2,20 19:22 20:11 janitors 13:11 24:15,24 25:8 31:11,14 51:23 59:8.9.17 **January** 30:6,7 hot-button 56:11 increasing 17:9 job 36:17 housing 35:5 incremental 20:11 join 8:10 How's 2:15 independent 55:4 human 8:25 12:12 27:22 28:17 indication 10:23 32:10,14 **Industries** 8:6 hundred 13:22 21:20 22:4.20 inform 22:1 25:13 27:2 hurry 55:18 jump 7:4 information 4:22 10:18,25 25:2, hybrid 6:14 36:8 21 27:3,10,15 28:19 33:17 37:22 42:4 50:2.24 59:3 Т

items 10:14 27:3 29:12,14 47:22 J judges 9:25 11:22 judicial 13:25 21:9 44:23 July 18:24 23:23 **June** 3:12 5:17,20 6:5 9:10,18,19 27:2 30:16 31:1 38:1 39:1,5 41:18 informative 6:1 48:7 jurisdiction 54:23 55:2 informed 5:6 37:17 Κ infrastructure 49:17 insight 20:20 **K-12** 27:22 28:17 **institutional** 42:8 44:19 instructed 29:11 56:1,8 instructive 6:2 25:6

idea 38:1 52:19 identified 26:8 identifies 24:9 illustrate 19:18 20:14 impact 18:19 31:24

impacts 19:1

implementation 43:1

kind 17:19 19:18 37:12 40:1 43:2 44:18 51:21 52:16,19 53:23 55:22

kinds 53:15 54:21

insurance 42:25 44:6,11 46:4,7 49:1

L

labor 7:24 13:19 15:4 28:20

lack 45:9 land 27:21

landscape 46:10

language 52:2 53:4 54:4

LAO 40:10

large 14:4 28:2

larger 18:10

largest 13:9 20:25

lastly 20:2

Laura 2:4 4:2 8:4 58:14

law 7:1

lawyers 14:14

leadership 7:24

learning 5:18

led 45:7

left 54:19

legal 39:20 57:11

legislation 40:5 45:18,20 52:13 55:11,14

legislations 33:2

legislative 10:4 13:25 21:9 32:21 39:12 42:3 44:23 45:5

legislature 15:2 25:10 30:13 40:4 45:24 53:23

letter 10:8 29:22 30:15,20,22,24

1etter 10:8 29:22 30:15,20,22,24 51:13 56:25

level 14:13 49:11

levels 10:2 15:9

lifeguards 14:23

limbo 37:20

limited 46:12 49:14 54:19

limiting 3:3 lines 57:4

listed 9:12 17:12

litigation 52:22

local 8:4.7.16 42:20.22

locally 8:17

long 57:22

longevity 17:16

longstanding 45:17

lot 10:18 37:22 40:6 50:18,24

love 36:7 lucky 8:17

М

made 13:17 14:5 27:10 42:9

major 42:16

make 4:23 5:7 9:14 13:6 25:7 31:14 37:3,17 38:13,25 39:2 47:19

51:18

making 45:10 49:3

managed 29:9

managers 13:18

manufacturing 8:19

mapped 14:7 15:14

Margaret 2:10 4:8 8:15 58:20

Margarita 8:11

marked 6:4

materials 8:13

matter 5:1

max 17:5 18:3.5 24:22

maximum 17:7

May's 10:10

meaning 31:9

means 34:25

measures 5:22

mechanisms 29:1

meet 5:12 34:11 51:16

meeting 2:23 3:13 4:21 5:16,20 6:5,6,15,18 9:9,10,17,18,19 10:11 11:9,11 36:9,22 37:7 38:1,11 59:13

meetings 5:16,17 37:7

member 7:12,22 8:24 41:20,21

48:22 55:4

members 2:22 3:14,16 25:9 39:23 41:12.23 43:21 45:6 49:20 52:11

Index: labor..negotiated

54:10,13,23 55:3 57:14

mentioned 17:16 18:3 23:16

28:16 30:24 33:1 47:8

met 7:12 31:5,10,12 32:4

methodology 15:11

Michael 2:12,14 4:10 8:20 58:22

microphone 2:3

mid 10:8

middle 4:21

million 29:7 35:6

minimum 24:24

minute 41:2

minutes 3:4,11,12,17 9:18

miscellaneous 19:11

missed 9:1

moment 30:6 37:20

month 8:14 30:7

monthly 11:17,18,19,21

months 4:18 16:21 24:22 38:12

motion 3:19,20,21,25 57:7,10

58:9,10,11 59:7,9

move 12:8 31:13 38:24 56:14

moving 29:10,15

multiple 5:12

mutually-agreeable 38:17

N

narrow 45:18

narrowed 45:21

narrowing 46:16

nature 14:19

necessarily 6:13 17:9 50:10

needed 53:25 57:3,20

negative 30:1,2 31:6,22 32:1

negotiate 17:1 24:2,3,4,6

negotiated 17:6 18:8,10,14,22

19:15 20:9,16 26:7

Meeting held 3-12-24 Transcript on 03/12/2024 Index: negotiations..practices negotiations 13:3 16:14 24:5 26:6 pensionable 22:14 opine 52:15 net 29:7 32:24 42:12 opinion 39:20 41:5 51:8,9 52:8,23 **people** 5:10 6:10 37:25 38:7 56:6,9 56:20 57:11 **PEPRA** 19:4 23:6 nineteen 52:3 opportunity 2:22 5:6,11 36:2 non-peace 18:11,17 19:19,25 percent 19:15,24 20:1 21:22 22:1, 58:25 11 23:17 28:8,9,13,24 30:2,8 31:7, non-profit 8:5 opposition 59:12 21 46:20 47:9,16 non-profits 8:7 **Ops** 28:22 percentage 21:17 22:10,17 24:15, 25 31:19 34:6 normal 14:18 17:11 18:6 19:5 23:9 option 38:15 28:12 percentages 11:3 17:22,24 18:1 orange 8:10 18:9 19:16 North 52:20 21:23 24:17 25:6 order 29:2 31:19 Perfect 23:24 48:20 note 27:9 28:23 30:9 organization 8:12 29:9 54:6 **notice** 10:22 period 28:3 33:21 organizations 45:1 notified 50:11 PERSABLE 22:16,18,20 originally 43:24 November 27:13 **person** 5:12,21 6:8,12,13,19,22 outreach 49:21 7:12 36:7 37:7,15 38:1,9,11 number 4:18 21:4.5 23:3 45:16 personal 27:18 overview 26:24,25 48:10 47:22 **numbers** 21:11 30:10,14 50:6 owed 43:11 **phase** 20:10 **nurses** 13:12 phones 38:6 Ρ piece 40:24 0 pipelines 49:17 p.m. 2:1 place 20:5 33:15 52:25 objectives 44:21 package 18:14,18 plan 5:15 14:5 **obligation** 39:4 59:1 packages 50:23 **pocket** 18:15 observations 4:20 panels 48:24 point 8:23 10:24 11:5 14:17 22:11 occupation 14:8,9 15:16 part 17:10 18:5,13,17 19:12 44:22 25:20 27:9 29:24 36:14 50:16 47:11 54:10 occupations 13:6 14:11 15:12 54:25 55:21 24:10 participating 6:23 policy 20:4,5 23:6 occur 7:11 passage 39:14,18 poll 6:10 38:7 October 27:12 passed 40:4 polling 38:20 offhand 21:20 past 4:18 23:2 36:25 population 21:18 24:19 office 15:10 39:12 41:6 42:3 45:1, Pause 42:10 position 15:21 21:6 25:4 48:14 11 46:8 47:11 48:13 51:9,14,18 pay 15:25 16:1 17:12,14,16 18:20 55:5 52:15,21 53:11 56:7,25 19:1 22:15,18,20 39:22 52:9 57:13 **positions** 13:7,20 14:4 21:21 22:3 officer 10:4 paying 41:12 48:9 officers 14:14 16:2 18:11,15,17 payments 43:6 positive 31:24 19:19,24,25 25:9 26:1 payroll 14:17 15:9 23:11 possibility 38:11 officials 9:22,24 25:18 40:12 52:6 peace 14:14 16:2 18:11,15 19:19, post 47:21 ongoing 26:4,5 24 potential 17:10 24:25 27:2 29:12 **OPEB** 20:8 **peak** 14:19 potentially 30:11 56:14 open 36:13 38:20 41:9

practices 20:21 43:25 45:13

pension 19:3,6 23:7

operations 45:10

CALIFORNIA CITIZENS COMPENSATION COMMISSION Meeting held 3-12-24 Transcript on 03/12/2024

practicing 8:24 raised 44:20.25 project 37:14 pre 23:7 44:18 47:21 projected 27:8 30:1 Rancho 8:11 pre-funding 20:4 projections 32:3 range 13:11 14:12 16:20 17:8 18:5 preferable 38:16 **Prop** 29:19 rank 21:22 preferential 6:11 properties 49:12,14 rates 19:7,8,23 20:11,15 prefunding 16:4 property 42:17,19 43:25 44:4,11 re-examine 52:9 46:4,7 48:25 49:2,3,4,10 prepare 48:9 51:13 reach 5:7 proposal 30:12 35:7 preparing 10:17 reason 40:13 proposed 29:5 present 2:5,7,9,11 12:22 42:4 recall 51:23 proposition 29:19 52:3 presentation 12:11 20:19 23:15 receive 15:17 16:1 17:10 18:4 26:16,24 35:21 36:16 39:12 41:2,8 22:15 23:23 24:21 provide 5:4 10:9 12:2 15:5 25:20 46:22 26:25 31:11,13 35:24 37:9 39:9,25 receives 15:23 48:5 50:20 58:25 presentations 6:1 37:9.12 Receiving 43:5 provided 17:21 19:21 30:15 32:13 presented 4:22 27:1 37:22 recent 12:23 18:8 providing 17:21 presenters 8:13 recently 17:6,19 20:8 45:11 **PSSSA** 32:23 presenting 48:8 recommend 37:15 **public** 2:22,23 3:1,3,7 15:6 19:3 pretty 21:10,21 28:2 40:11 53:9 32:14,22 49:23 recruitment 17:2 previewed 36:1 publically 15:2 redirection 45:15 previous 19:17 pulled 33:24 34:10,21 reduce 39:22 52:10 54:3 57:13 previously 30:24 33:1 pulling 29:3 reduced 39:23 47:9 55:11 57:14 **PRIDE** 8:6 purpose 26:24 40:3 reduction 35:8 39:13 40:11 47:16 primarily 49:1,3 52:11 55:7 purview 2:24 40:8 **print** 47:6 reductions 23:3 29:10 34:24 35:4 push 2:20 printed 47:3 refer 16:16 19:3 pushed 40:6 prior 3:15 10:10 20:6 27:10 44:9, reference 42:14 put 17:17 34:14 52:7 22 46:17 47:10 referred 17:23 30:19 private 15:6 Q referring 41:11 proceed 52:21 refers 17:7 quasi-judicial 43:14 44:14 45:3 process 4:21 5:4,10 6:2 20:17 reflected 45:4 35:17 36:3,13 38:24 40:15,24 45:5 question 10:20 20:24 22:7 23:13 49:11 reflects 26:7 24:1,13 25:24 32:17 33:23 34:9 40:19 48:12 49:22 50:7.25 51:21. product 23:5 reform 19:3 46:10 24 52:7 53:13,16 54:3,8 56:3,4 productive 36:13 **reforms** 46:18 questions 10:13 11:14 20:21,23 products 8:19 24:12 30:18 32:6 35:11 46:23 59:5 **regions** 17:15 professional 7:18 related 16:3 quick 24:13 program 35:6 relations 13:19 R programs 35:5 relevant 29:16 45:8 progression 17:11 18:6 remaining 34:5 railroads 49:18

Index: practicing..remaining

retirement 16:4 18:16 19:2

retroactive 53:18,20

return 33:6

Meeting held 3-12-24 Transcript on 03/12/2024 Index: reminder..showing scheduled 5:17 18:22 26:9 reminder 59:1 returns 43:6 removal 29:5 school 9:22 32:22 35:5 revenue 27:10 29:3,8 30:14 42:16, 19,20 removed 45:23 scientists 26:2 revenue-generating 45:16 report 4:13 9:2 10:2 11:13 14:25 scope 44:18 45:18 50:11 49:23 50:2 revenues 27:17,24 28:11 30:3,6 Search 7:22 31:8,21 33:21 reporting 33:20 **season** 14:21 review 27:13 47:20 reports 9:5 15:1,3 seasonal 14:13,19 revision 28:24 30:10.17 representatives 24:7 **seat** 8:5 right-hand 20:12 28:1 represented 13:5,14 22:3 **secretary** 3:8 12:9 Rights 8:25 representing 13:9 section 28:20 **Roberts** 2:6,7 3:23,24 4:4,5 7:17, represents 13:3 21:17 24:9 30:1 18 25:23 26:10 33:23 34:2,6,10,14, sector 15:6 22 37:11 50:17 58:7,8,16,17 59:11 **sectors** 15:13 request 39:20 51:8 56:20,24 57:11 robust 48:10 seek 23:8 required 54:10 role 41:1 45:3 **seeks** 19:4 requirement 6:19 30:25 31:3 38:4 roll 40:5 49:7.12 58:13 54:13 **SEIU** 13:8 21:20,25 room 38:17 requirements 29:20 seniority 16:1 17:16 rule 45:10 49:2 Rescue 7:23 sense 30:5 37:25 rules 6:24 38:12,14 reserve 29:7 32:18,25 34:7 separately 55:1 running 36:25 reserves 29:3.4 32:20 33:3.24.25 served 7:20 runway 35:25 34:11,19,21 service 10:2 26:23 resolution 9:18,20 31:4,13 35:18 rushed 5:9 services 27:22 28:17 32:11,12,13, 41:12,18 51:11,16 56:19 57:4 14,15 resolved 56:23 S serving 44:13 45:3 resources 12:12 45:16 sessions 26:3 Sacramento 8:4,16 response 54:19 set 49:14 **safety** 29:7 32:24,25 responsibilities 4:24 39:13.24 setting 12:14 35:18 54:5 salaries 10:1 11:21 25:14 40:20 40:6,7,12 44:1,5,8,10,19 45:19,22 53:21 46:1,3,13 48:22 49:20 52:12 54:20 SFEU 29:21 31:6 32:25 55:10 56:13 57:15 **salary** 9:19,21 10:2 11:6 15:23,24 share 36:2.11 16:10,13,17,20,23,24 17:4,5,7,8, responsibility 5:21 46:10 sharing 19:4 20,23 18:2,5,6,10,20 19:17,22 responsible 14:24 44:13 22:11,15 24:18,22 52:5,10 **shift** 35:7 responsive 38:21 salary-setting 13:16 shifted 46:8 49:25 result 5:3 27:13 40:9 55:11 sales 27:19 42:17,20 44:12 shifts 34:24 35:7 retention 17:2 San 8:21.24 short 45:20 retiree 16:5 20:2.4 23:7 **Santa** 8:11 shortfall 27:8

show 14:3 20:14 23:23

showed 33:12

showing 28:9

Sarah 38:12 39:3

saved 10:7

savings 29:12

Index: shows..talked structure 14:10 16:10 44:20 54:5 student 14:13 **studies** 15:18 subject 19:9 submitted 15:2 subsequent 56:10 sufficient 57:5 suggest 32:3 suggesting 36:21 summarize 42:8 **summary** 10:3,5 **summer** 14:22 superintendents 9:23 superior 9:25 10:21 supervisors 13:18 supplement 11:9 support 8:5 29:9 37:4,6 supported 29:13 supporting 8:7 surveys 9:21 Sweet 2:1,12,15,17 3:12,21,24 4:10,11,14 6:21 7:3,6,9 8:2,20,21 10:12,19 11:4,12,14 12:4,6,16 20:23 22:6,19,23 24:12 25:3,15 26:11,14 30:19 31:9,16 32:6 35:10, 14,20 37:24 38:4,23 39:3,7,16,25 41:14,16,22,24 42:1,11 48:21 49:6 50:7.13.18 51:20 55:16 56:22 57:9. 16 58:3,8,11,22,23 59:10,12 **system** 42:7,15 43:1,16 44:8 systems 14:2 Т

tab 3:13 9:8 10:7,21 41:16

take-home 18:19 19:1

tabs 9:7

talk 4:19

talked 32:9

taking 16:12

shows 10:22 18:25 20:10 27:23 28:14 44:7 46:9

side 23:7 43:8,9 47:4,6

signed 40:5

significant 21:10,21 23:3 40:11 48:1

significantly 46:17

similar 25:17 sincere 8:12 single 17:24

sit 48:23

situation 36:18 37:17,21

slide 13:1,21 19:18 21:14 22:7,10, 23 23:2,14 24:14 25:25 27:20,23 28:14 29:15 30:5 33:12 34:3,15,17, 23

slides 12:17 20:18 32:9 33:12 42:14 50:19,21

small 8:18 **smaller** 42:24

snapshot 17:20 37:13

SNARR 2:4,6,8,10,12 3:10 4:2,4,6, 8,10,13 9:4,14,17 11:2,10,13,19, 22,25 12:2,5,11 26:15 35:16 39:11, 17 58:14,16,18,20,22

Social 32:15 solutions 27:7

sort 21:25 30:5 44:20,24 46:9,16

sorts 49:5,21

sounds 41:11 53:1

source 42:20

sources 42:16,19

South 8:10

space 29:8 38:10

speak 2:23 23:4 25:4 26:5 33:13

speaker 3:4

speaking 16:8 34:13 57:8

special 16:24 17:4,5 18:2 24:17

29:17,22 31:2

specific 16:18 17:1,2 18:12 19:21

33:16

specifically 29:21 32:21

spending 29:12

spent 8:6

spike 28:2 33:13

split 13:5 19:5

spoken 51:2

spot 10:7 **spring** 8:22

stabilization 29:6 32:21.22

staff 4:16 6:9 8:12 9:2,4 11:13 35:20 38:7,19 39:8 46:18 47:19 48:5 50:20 51:13 53:7 55:24 56:19 57:2,20 58:1,13 59:3

staffing 46:17 47:16

stakeholders 30:13

stand 30:6

standpoint 16:12

Star 52:20

start 13:1 41:10 43:13 52:25

started 16:21 20:9

starting 9:13 10:24 11:5

state 7:7,20,24 9:21 10:1 12:22,24 13:7,22,24 14:1,9,12 15:6,8,9,10, 15,20 16:9,21,22 17:15,24 18:23 19:4,8 20:20,25 21:4 25:13 26:17 27:1 37:17 39:14 42:19,21 43:17, 23 46:2,13,15 52:6 54:18

state's 13:4 20:3 42:7,15,25 43:1 44:8

statewide 14:4 Statistics 15:5 status 31:1,6 statute 44:2

statutorily 45:24

statutorily-created 54:17

statutory 46:1

stay 38:13

step 41:3 43:14,15

stretch 5:3

strictly 46:12

Donna Nichols, RPR, CSR donna.nichols@comcast.net

CALIFORNIA CITIZENS COMPENSATION COMMISSION Meeting held 3-12-24 Transcript on 03/12/2024 Index: talking..voting talking 34:24 tied 12:24 uncertainties 29:17.23 31:2 talks 16:7 understand 6:6 34:8 time 3:1,6 4:25 5:7 14:17 27:9 29:25 30:15 44:5 50:5 51:16 53:12, understanding 36:17 40:9,10,16 targeted 16:25 16.21 Task 7:23 uniformity 45:9 times 5:13 9:13 14:20 tasked 46:12 unintelligible 2:2 35:1 41:25 timetable 35:17 42:23 43:4,5,7 46:4 47:12 48:6 tax 27:13,18,19 29:9 33:5 42:7,15, **timing** 36:3 16,17,18,19,21,25 43:1,5,7,9,16,25 44:8,12,15,16,17 46:5,8 48:13 today 3:15 5:16,25 9:8 12:20 24:24 union 13:9 24:4.9 49:1,2,5,10 37:22 42:4 50:21 51:10 56:18 unions 13:8 24:7 taxed 45:22 today's 9:9 40:3 unit 15:1 16:18 17:25 18:12,14 told 21:3 taxes 27:19 42:16,17,18,24 43:6, 19:17,20 21:17 23:22 25:1,17 51:9 11 44:4,6,11,12,15 46:3,6,14 49:3 52:8 top 27:21 28:18 taxpayer 39:15,18 43:5,10,12 **units** 13:4,6,10 17:6 18:7,23 19:7, total 13:8,19,21,23 14:25 18:13,18 49:20 12 20:7,9,15 26:8 19:5 21:10,18 22:4,11 23:9 34:2,7, **Team** 7:23 unofficial 9:9 20 technology 8:19 touch 54:22 unprecedented 27:11 teleconference 6:18,19 town 7:20 up-to-date 37:13 telephonic 38:11 track 51:17 upcoming 5:23 tells 32:1 trajectory 28:4 **update** 37:16 ten 19:14 20:6 transcripts 9:9,12 updates 12:13,23 17:18 36:18 **Tennefoss** 26:19,22 30:23 31:12, transferred 54:17 **upper** 28:1 20 32:2,12,20 33:8,16,19 34:1,4,8, Transparency 39:19 Urban 7:22 12.16 35:2.13 transparent 39:15 **utility** 49:16 terms 11:2 29:16 35:6 51:21 52:20 56:12 trend 28:12 V thing 22:25 38:6 54:1,20 55:22 trigger 32:4 56:1.8 turned 2:3 variety 42:24 things 14:24 28:20 30:6 45:4 twelve 24:22 vary 11:1 19:8 24:25 49:16,17,18 54:22 two-piece 40:24 vein 54:16 thinking 16:11 18:17 55:16 **types** 16:13 17:13 versus 32:14 **Thompson** 2:8,9 4:6,7 8:8,9 9:11, 16 11:16,20,23 12:1,3 21:13,16,24 Tyren 2:8 4:6 8:9 58:18 view 28:10 56:2 22:5 23:1,13,20,24 25:16,22 32:8, Tyrone 9:12 virtually 5:20 6:23 16 33:11,18,22 37:5 41:10,15,18 46:24 47:2,7,13 48:6 49:22 50:4 vision 16:6 53:1 57:6,9,10,22,25 58:4,18,19 U Vista 7:19 59:16 **UC** 21:4 volume 49:24 thought 35:24 40:23 **Uhler** 41:25 42:2,13 47:1,5,10,18 **vote** 4:1,25 5:22 36:7 51:8,23,25 thoughts 36:3,11 38:23

48:4,15,25 49:8 50:1

ultimate 25:6

ultimately 5:22 27:12

unanimous 59:13

57:3

voter 44:2

voters 43:20 45:25

voting 48:19

thousand 21:20 22:20 41:13

three- 20:10

tie 25:11

W
wage 15:5
wages 15:11
wanted 30:9 42:6 56:1
watching 28:5
website 15:3
week 5:1
white 17:22
who've 4:17
wiser 37:3
wishes 2:25 3:5
Women's 8:14
wondering 11:16 21:16
Wong 2:10,11,13,16 4:8,9 8:15,16 20:24 21:3,12 24:1,11 32:17 33:5, 10 36:15 37:6 38:3,22,25 39:6 41:20,23 47:25 53:17 55:6,15 58:6, 20,21 59:15
word 24:2 53:2 57:1,2
work 6:9 13:19 14:19 15:4 19:11 25:17 30:22 47:8 50:5,13 51:12,17 56:19
workforce 14:12 28:21
working 8:6 14:1 42:11
workload 46:20
works 6:10
wrong 32:23 53:7
Υ
year 5:2,8,14,23 7:2 8:23 11:3 14:18,20 18:19 19:21 27:13 30:8 33:6 36:12 49:25 51:16 56:14
years 7:21,25 8:6,17 16:22 20:6,11 23:2 43:20 44:1 50:12
yellow 19:10

Index: wage..Zoom